

Rethinking education

Finland's education export to Brazil

Puistolahti, Assi Marttiina Emilia

Master's thesis

Development Studies

Faculty of Social Sciences

University of Helsinki

April 2019



HELSINGIN YLIOPISTO
HELSINGFORS UNIVERSITET
UNIVERSITY OF HELSINKI

Tidioute/Osasto – Fakultet/Sektion – Faculty

Faculty of Social Sciences

Laitos – Institution – Department

Department of Political and Economic studies

Tekijä – Författare – Author

Assi Marttiina Emilia Puistolahti

Työn nimi – Arbetets titel – Title

Rethinking education: Finland's education export to Brazil

Oppiaine – Läroämne – Subject

Development Studies

Työn laji – Arbetets art –
Level

Master's thesis

Aika – Datum – Month and year

April 2019

Sivumäärä – Sidoantal – Number of pages

91

Tiivistelmä – Referat – Abstract

This thesis studies the roles of the Finnish state in the education export sector, focusing on the case of Finland-Brazil. The objective of this thesis is to seek the different discourses around education from 2010 to 2018 in the context of Finland, how these discourses define the role of education in development, and what is the significance of the change in the way we understand the role of education in a society.

In this study, education is analysed through the concepts of human capital, neoliberal education and public good in the context of development theories. In addition, Foucault's conceptualization of power and governmentality are analysed within the theories of post developmental critique.

The study is divided in the following parts. The first part consists of theoretical and conceptional framework, and the methodologies of the study. The second part provides an analysis on the policy documents of Finnish education export conducting a discourse analysis on how Finnish education export is perceived in media. Additionally, a qualitative data analysis is conducted of the interviews and qualitative research questionnaire. Discourse analysis is used to analyse the context in which the education export is functioning and has functioned. The final part of the study consists of the discussion and conclusion.

The primary data consist of interviews that represent three different actors in the Finnish education export (governmental, private and public education institutions), a research questionnaire, as well as media coverage from Finnish and Brazilian media and governmental documents from Finland and Brazil.

The findings of this thesis demonstrate that while in classic education theories, the roles, functions and objectives of education are of a common good has the framing of education been changing towards a neoliberal direction. The findings indicate of a profitable new market for Finnish education export globally. Additionally, while education export is being promoted as a solution for global education crisis to improve education quality and increase equality of global education, there are no clear indications that education export as such has any apparent intention to truly improve the quality of education globally. Moreover, the analysed discourses in this research show that the role of the Finnish actors operating in the field of education export are not required to have any impact in the receiving countries.

The case of Finnish education export to Brazil indicates that the Finnish state actively promotes education export to the global south through different discourses. The findings of the thesis lay out a vision of a relatively new industry that operates in the very core of the creation of individual identities and societies but is operated with market-driven interests that neglect the public good notion of education. Therefore, the impacts and opportunities for regional development and economic growth through education export remain minimal, while the business is relatively lucrative and risk free for private companies creating new ways to frame education.

Avainsanat – Nyckelord – Keywords

Education export, Commoditization of education, Education and state, Privatization of education, Brazil, Development



HELSINGIN YLIOPISTO
HELSINGFORS UNIVERSITET
UNIVERSITY OF HELSINKI

Tiedekunta/Osasto – Fakultet/Sektion – Faculty

Laitos – Institution – Department

Valtiotieteellinen tiedekunta

Politiikan ja talouden tutkimuksen laitos

Tekijä – Författare – Author

Assi Marttiina Emilia Puistolahti

Työn nimi – Arbetets titel – Title

Rethinking education: Finland's education export to Brazil

Oppiaine – Läroämne – Subject

Kehitysviennin tutkimus

Työn laji – Arbetets art – Level

Aika – Datum – Month and year

Sivumäärä – Sidoantal – Number of pages

Pro gradu- tutkielma

Huhtikuu 2019

91

Tiivistelmä – Referat – Abstract

Tutkielma tarkastelee Suomen valtion roolia koulutusvientisektorilla keskittyen suomalaisten yritysten ja instituutioiden projekteihin Brasiliassa. Tutkielmassa selvitetään Suomen valtion tapoja kehystää koulutusvientiä sekä sitä kautta määrittää koulutusta ja sen roolia yhteiskunnassa. Tutkielma keskittyy Suomen valtion diskurssin muutoksen havainnollistamiseen vuosina 2010–2018 tutkien eri rooleja, joita valtio voi ottaa uudella vientisektorilla.

Tutkielmassa valtion koulutusviennin diskurssin muutosta analysoidaan inhimillisen pääoman, neoliberaalin koulutuksen ja "koulutus julkisena hyvänä" -käsitteiden avulla keskeisten kehityksen teorioiden kontekstissa. Tämän lisäksi tutkielmassa tarkastellaan yleistä koulutuksen diskurssin muutosta Foucault:n vallan konseptualisoinnin kautta sekä "post developmentalistisen" kritiikin linssin läpi.

Tutkielma jakautuu seuraavasti: ensimmäinen osa esittelee tapaustutkimuksen teoreettisen ja konseptuaalisen viitekehyksen sekä tutkielmassa käytetyt menetelmät. Toinen osa tutkielmasta keskittyy aineiston analyysiin käyttäen kvalitatiivisia menetelmiä, erityisesti diskurssianalyysejä, sekä esittelee keskeiset johtopäätökset.

Tutkimus suoritettiin laadullisesti. Aineisto kerättiin haastatteluista sekä laadullisesta sähköpostikyselylomakkeesta. Otokseen kuuluu vastauksia niin yksityisen kuin julkisen sektorin koulutusviennitoimijoilta sekä valtion edustajilta. Tämän lisäksi tutkielman toissijaisena aineistona on käytetty julkisia artikkeleita Suomen ja Brasilian lehdistöstä sekä virallisia valtion julkaisuja Suomesta ja Brasiliasta.

Tutkielman johtopäätökset osoittavat koulutukseen liittyvien perinteisten kehysten muuttuneen koulutuksen tuotteistamisen seurauksena. Tapaustutkimus Suomen koulutusviennistä Brasiliaan osoittaa, että suomalainen koulutus on tuotteistettu vientituotteeksi. Tutkielma osoittaa, että Suomen valtion rooli koulutuksen tuotteistamisen edistämässä on selvästi kasvanut vuodesta 2010 vuoteen 2018. Samalla myös koulutusviennin sektori ja siihen sisältyvä liikevaihto on kasvanut.

Tutkielmasta selviää koulutusviennin diskurssin keskittyvän koulutuksen myyntiin ja siitä saatavaan liikevaihtoon. Tutkielman aineistosta selviää, ettei suomalaisilta toimijoilta odoteta hankkeiden laaduntarkkailua tai vaikutusta kohdemaan koulutuksen kehitykseen. Havainnon perusteella voidaan olettaa, ettei Suomen koulutusviennillä ole juuri vaikutuksia Brasilian taloudelliseen tai yhteiskunnalliseen kehitykseen. Koulutusviennin tarkoituksen ei voida tutkielman tulosten valossa olevan parantaa koulutuksen laatua tai koulutuksen saatavuutta. Koulutuksesta on tuotteistamisen seurauksena tullut Suomessa sekä kansainvälisesti uusi tuottava vientituote, joka suuntautuu erityisesti globaalista pohjoisesta globaaliin etelään.

Avainsanat – Nyckelord – Keywords

Koulutusvienti, koulutuksen tuotteistaminen, koulutuksen yksityistäminen, koulutus ja valtio, kehitys, Brasilia

Table of Contents

Abstracts.....	i
1 Introduction	2
1.1 Theoretical and conceptual framework.....	4
1.2 Methods and Material	7
2 Theoretical and conceptual framework.....	9
2.1 Neoliberal education in Latin America.....	10
2.2 The human capital.....	14
2.3 Knowledge, power and education as a commodity.....	17
2.4 States role	21
2.5 Education as a commodity.....	26
3 Methodology and data analysis	28
3.1 Case study approach	28
3.2 Discourse analysis	32
3.3 Documentary analysis	34
3.4 Interviews and the research questionnaire	37
3.5 Data collection	40
4 Education export	44
4.1 The case: Finnish education export to Brazil	48
4.2 The states role in education export	51
4.3 Impact of education export in the receiving countries.....	58
4.4 Liability of the research and research problems	65
5 Discussion.....	68
5.1 Discourse in education export	68
5.2 Quality of education as a commodity	72
5.3 Impact of education export	75
5.4 Rethinking education	81
6 Conclusions	84
7 References.....	86
Appendix	92
1. Primary data sources	92
2. Secondary data sources	97

1 Introduction

Development studies is a multilevel, problem focused and a complex field of studies, thus a critical perspective is generally more of a norm than an exception. Therefore, it is rare to have an issue that is almost universally accepted as a desirable “tool” for development, sense even the word “development” is an issue of debate. Education’s impact on development, both on social as well as on economic level, is one of the few matters that is rarely contested. It is commonly argued that a state should allocate resources in education in order to create individual and societal development (Schultz, 1971; Psacharopoulos, 1985; Smith, 2007 (1776), 1 UN, 2017).

Education sector is never an isolated part of the society. It is not subjected to special treatment or excluded from the influence of global political changes and discourses. As education is generally a desired and a necessary part of development it is relevant to consider the changes in the discourse around it.

In this master’s thesis I will analyse the impacts of the different discourses of education in the field of development through the case of Finnish education export to Brazil. Moreover, this research contributes to the discussion on commoditization and privatization of education and the possible impact it has on individuals and societies.

The study focuses on states discourse of education export in Finland between 2010 and 2018. My hypothesis is that from 2010 until 2018 the focus on the discourse around education export from Finland has changed towards a market-driven approach. Therefore, giving legitimization to the commoditization of education.

The research questions are:

RQ 1: What is Finnish education export in Brazil and what kind of roles the Finnish state has in it?

RQ 2: What is the impact of education export in the receiving countries?

RQ 3: How do the Finnish actors perceive their role as education exporters?

RQ 4: What is the effect of monetary capital in education?

The thesis is divided in three parts. The first part consists of theoretical and conceptual framework with a focus on education's role in development theory and on state's role in education export.

The second part consists of a discourse analysis on how the discourse around Finnish education export sector is formed, and what role's the Finnish state takes in this particular export sector. A qualitative data analysis is conducted from the collected primary and secondary data, which includes semi-structured interviews, a research questionnaire, and documentary analysis of media articles and from governmental documents.

The third part consists of further analysis of the data, through the provided theoretical framework, as well as a conclusion of the results of this research.

1.1 Theoretical and conceptual framework

The United Nations (UN) has given education a substantial emphasize in its 2030 sustainable development agenda (1 UN, 2017). The sustainable development goal number four (4) states that “obtaining a quality education is the foundation to creating sustainable development. In addition to improving quality of life, access to inclusive education can help equip locals with the tools required to develop innovative solutions to the world’s greatest problems. (ibid)”

According to the UN over 265 million children are not in school and 22% of these children are in the age of primary school. In addition, the children that attend school lack basic skills, such as reading and math. There are many reasons for the lack of quality in education. UN identifies the following as the most critical ones: (1) “lack of adequately trained teachers, (2) poor conditions of schools and (3) equity issues related to opportunities provided to rural children (2 UN, 2018)”.

Insufficient or lack of investment in education is acknowledged as one of the main reasons why the quality of education remains poor in many schools. As primary and secondary education have been estimated to create higher social and individual returns than higher education, have many governments allocated most of the resources earmarked to education to these levels. As the wage gap between university graduates and non-university graduates remains remarkably high, has more and more emphasis been given also to higher education. (Psacharopoulos, 1989: 7-9)

Additionally, Evans (2010) argues that the main goal of a 21st century developmental state is to enhance human capabilities. Evans identifies countries such as South Korea and Singapore, as well as the Nordic states as the types of countries, that have had the capacity to transform the structure of their economies and to become globally competitive, create jobs, as well as reduce poverty and inequality. Evans argues that this was achieved through “investments in education, health and skills development, as well as infrastructure (ibid: 6)”.

Therefore, Evans identifies institutions as one of the main aspects for developmental success. Moreover, institutions need to “enhance, rather than undermine the capacity of the state to

promote its development efforts (ibid: 6)". This is the case of creating a "developmental state". Developmental state in this thesis is defined as a democratic developmental state. (ibid.)

The theoretical and conceptional discussion in this study is divided in two parts; (1) education in the context of development theories (2) education as a commodity and the states role in education export.

This study uses Marx's definition of commodity, thus limiting it to the concept of capitalist commodity. (Marx, 1906) Harvey (2010) argues that Marx is ultimately interested in the "simple fact that people buy commodities and that this act is foundational to how people live".

Marx conceptualizes commodity by using a concept of use-value. Commodity is then defined as an object, a thing that can be exchanged for something that has of use to the other that exchanges it. Use-values commodities thus may differ in quality and as exchange-values they may differ in quantity. Moreover, Marx considers all commodities as products of human labor. (ibid.)

Education as a commodity as argued before is different from other commodities. It shares many of the characteristics of a public good. This means, among other things, a key role for governments in protecting the sector, and enabling the private entities to enter the sector.

Neomarxist analysis, can open more in detail the neoliberal transformations within which the international commoditization of education is located in contemporary Brazil. Several theorists are helpful here. The concept of human capital by Theodore Schultz is analysed in this study as a means for creating economic growth. Schultz's use of the concept of human capital in the context of marketization of education emphasizes the increase in the wealth of the exporting country and development of the education sector of the importing country. (Schultz, 1971)

Evans (2010) argues that the 21st century developmental state is changing, but that there is still importance on the states role, although it is significantly different than the role it previously had. Importantly the states role in education export is significant from both sides, from the exporting and the importing countries.

Discourse of education as a commodity signals also dangers of monopolization of knowledge, which are discussed through the theories of Paolo Freire and Michel Foucault of the perspective of power and education. Freire's and Foucault's theories on power are essential in order to understand the hidden power relations that may lie under the practises of education to analyse the power of change in discourses.

Additionally, a post-developmental critique on the colonality of power and modernity in the context of commoditization of education provides an alternative way of understanding the phenomena.

The relation between modernity, education and power are analysed through Escobar's and Mignolo's theories. Moreover, Mignolo argues that modernity serves only the global north through the creation of unequal power structures at the cost of the global south. (Mignolo, 2011) It has been argued that modernity always includes colonialism, and that through colonialism modernity is always a form of power relations. (Escobar, 1992) Thus, when modernity is understood as a result of unequal power relations historically between global south and global north, it is relevant to analyse education's role in development through post developmental critique.

1.2 Methods and Material

This research is conducted by using qualitative methodologies and following a case study approach. Qualitative data enables an analysis of what the policy actions are, how they have been implemented and what are the possible effects of these implementation processes. The sources of data include published reports from mass media sources, policy documents, and interviews of different actors in the Finnish education export sectors, as well as a research questionnaire.

The methods of the study are based on a case study approach, where data is collected by using various methodologies, so that the researched phenomenon can be understood more deeply. (Metsämuuronen, 2006: 90-91)

The analysis of this study is based on discourse analysis. Discourse analysis is generally used to interrogate the “situatedness of knowledge, the contextuality of discourses and the active role which spatial images play in political life (Dittmer, 2010: 274)”. Discourse analysis can be divided in post-structuralist and structuralist ways. Structuralist follows Gramscian way of theorizing discourse as a hegemonic power and where “discourse is almost synonymous with hegemony itself so far as it functions to conceal the power of vested interests and to induce the consent of the dominated to their own domination (Lees, 2004: 102)”.

Whereas, “in Foucauldian terms, discourses are not simply reflections or (mis)reflections of “reality”; rather they create their own “regimes of truth”- the acceptable formulation of problems and solutions to those problems (Lees, 2004:102-3)”, which means that in post-structuralist terms we can understand subjectivity the way that individuals engage with different discourses and social practices. (Dittmer, 2010:277) Foucauldian way of conducting discourse analysis is thus intertwined with the terms of governmentality and power which are central concepts of this study.

In this research two specific themes were chosen to analyse the data in order to answer the indicated research questions; (1) states role, and (2) the quality and the impact of the education

export projects in the receiving countries. The coding frame used to analyse the data was created using these themes.

Primary data was collected by conducting face-to-face interviews in Finland, Helsinki, on November 2018, and via email on January 2019. The interviewed were of different sectors operating within the education export. Additionally, a qualitative research questionnaire was sent to education export actors operating in Finland and Brazil in May 2018.

In addition, reports from mass media and official governmental documents from 2010 to 2018 were selected as relevant secondary data. The articles and documents were selected both from Finland and Brazil in accordance with the relevance of the report for the research. Articles from different media sources were analyzed in order to get the widest possible perspective of the issue.

The purpose is to analyze the possible change in discourse in the Finnish policy documents that are or have previously been used as guiding framework for the actual actors in the education export field in Finland.

2 Theoretical and conceptual framework

"Education is a collection of practices and institutions that have been organized slowly in the course of time, which are comparable with all the other social institutions and which express them, and which, therefore, can no more be changed at will than the structure of the society itself"

- Émile Durkheim, 1956¹

To analyse the discourses in the Finnish education export practises to Brazil, it is important to understand the theories that play key roles in the practices of education export. It is especially important in order to answer the research questions of this thesis, but also to respond to a wider question of the role of education in development.

This chapter presents the theoretical and contextual framework of this research. The chapter introduces the development theories in education. In addition, the concept of human capital from the perspective of Theodore Schultz is analyzed as a tool for enforcing the discourse of education as a commodity. It presents the different roles a state can take in promoting a new trade sector according to the analysis by Peter Evans in the context of the case study Finland-Brazil. Moreover, it establishes the narratives as means of power that surround the politics of global education export sector, through theories of Foucault, Freire and Mignolo in the context of Latin America.

The theoretical and conceptual framework provides the necessary instruments to understand and investigate the discourse practices shaped by nation states, markets, and global institutions, which constitute to the education export practices in the case of Finland and Brazil. As the focus of this study is discourses it is relevant and necessary to examine the theoretical framework of the study from various perspectives.

¹ Durkheim, E. 1956. p.64

2.1 Neoliberal education in Latin America

“Education is fundamental to development and growth (World Bank, 2018)”.

William Robinson (2007), who has studied extensively the role of transnational capital (or what he calls the “transnational capitalist class”) in Latin America’s neoliberalizing contexts, defines neoliberalism in the following way: "global neoliberalism is a concrete program and an ideology, a culture, a philosophical worldview that takes classical liberalism and individualism to an extreme (ibid: 16)".

Neoliberalism is ultimately as Robinson (2007) argues "an ideological construct". Additionally, it is considered a particular element of globalisation. Robinson emphasises that neoliberalism should not be considered the same as globalisation, since it has independent forms of globalisation. (ibid.)

Robinson argues that there has been a transformation of Latin America’s political economy towards integration into global capitalism. Robinson states that this transformation and the intention to integrate into global capitalism has constituted to a social, political, cultural, ideological and institutional changes in the whole region. Robinson refers these as the transnational processes. (ibid.)

One of the main dimensions Robinson identifies is transnational class formation. Meaning, that as global capitalism advances in a society, the pre-globalization classes disappear giving way to new dominant and subordinate class groups. Robinson summarizes transnationalization of the class structure in Latin America the following way:

“The rise of new dominant groups and capitalist fractions tied to the global economy, the downward mobility, or proletarianization of older middle classes and professional strata and the rise of new middle and professional strata, proletarianization of peasants and the rise of new working-class constituencies, the working class itself becoming flexibilized and informalized, the appearance of an expanding mass of supernumeraries or marginalized (ibid: 167)”.

The composition of the class structure in Latin America in the early 20th was: 90% of subordinate classes and 10% of large-and medium sized employers, senior executives and professionals. The working class can be divided by the characterization of the labor: informal workers, the manual labor formal proletariat, and the non-manual labor proletariat. (ibid.)

Another dimension Robinson identifies is that transnational industrial activities are gaining more foothold in the Latin American markets. Robison identifies two types of transnational industrial activities: 1. "international reorientation of national industries established under import-substitution industrialization, 2. new forms of local industrial production in which output is geared toward export to global markets (ibid: 102)".

The decline of import-substitution industrialization industries is according to Robinson one of the main reasons why the old working class has reduced. This can have political implications, as the new middle classes and professional strata leaves room for as Robinson argues "a social base for neoliberal regimes and can become incorporated into the global capitalist bloc (ibid: 169)".

Clearly, there are no homogenous characteristics that would describe economies in the Latin America and the Caribbean as such. There are many differences between the economies in the region. Harris (2008) argues that over the last one hundred years the economic development of the region is more similar to underdevelopment or a dependent development. According to Harris most of the important sectors of the region's economies are dominated by transnational and foreign companies, mainly from global north.

In addition, he argues that the "pursuit of neoliberal policies that have encouraged foreign investments, the privatization of state assets and the opening up their economies (ibid: 88)" has led to a situation where the regions governments are not implementing necessary policies to combat inequality, injustices, or environmental threats on the region. (ibid.)

After the 1980's debt crisis, most of Latin American countries have been influenced by the international financial organization (such as, IMF and World Bank). In the 1970's commercial banks functioned as a "source of external funding", while the areas national governments built

the necessary infrastructure to attract foreign capital in the name of development policies, which is the so-called role of an enabling state. (Leher et al., 2016)

Since then, many countries in the region adopted the idea to become “safe for foreign capital”. This was done through adjustments, such as “labor and environmental deregulation, public service privatization and interest rate increases so as to attract financial capital (ibid: 23)”. This led to more inequality, unemployment, and poor quality of public services. (ibid.)

Following the adjustments social parties surged to power in many countries of the area in the early 2000’s. Leher et al. (2016) argue that in Brazil the workers party (Partido dos Trabalhadores) together with industrial sector favored policies that benefitted the capital and not the people.

The changes in the economic and political structures of the societies in Latin America and especially in Brazil have affected the way education is conceptualized in the region. Leher et al., (2016), who have studied the privatization of Brazilian higher education institutions and the roles of political and ideological agendas have in it, have identified the changes in Brazilian education politics into two periods of time: 1940’s to 1964, and 1984 onwards. The relevant time period for this study is the period after the military dictatorship in Brazil, 1984 onwards, without disregarding the impact historical changes in Latin American and Brazilian politics have for today and today. (ibid.)

In the two decades following Second World War, development strategies to be adopted in Brazil were based on three pillars: "an industrialization upsurge to quickly reach central capitalism’s economic levels; the idea that this initiative stemmed from a national project shared by the ruling political class, the state bureaucracy and the local bourgeoisie; the states taking the role of manager and main partner in enterprises (ibid: 24)".

These reforms were reached under the influence of huge public debt, high inflation and economic inequality. Moreover, these decisions were taken under a national development project. The wealth accumulated by the state during the Getulia Vargas era (1930-1944) and after were thus produced by the workers. (ibid.)

In the 1970's the "capital" started to call for a state reform, which was based in the ideologies of neoliberalism. In this "reform" the idea was to diminish the state interventions, as well as the costs of the state. Therefore, state and public funds were intertwined for the purpose of capital accumulation. The idea was that a larger share of public funds would return to the ruling class in the form of states and economic direction that would benefit the financial elite. (Leher et al., 2016).

Robinson's (2007) detailed study shows how the transformation of Latin America's political economy towards integration into global capitalism as well its effects in the class structure of the societies leaving base for neoliberal regimes in the region. Additionally, the region has been subjected to different developmental experiments, such as the implementation of neoliberal practises, which have also influenced the Brazilian education sectors development. (Leher et al., 2016)

2.2 The human capital

Evans (2010) argues that especially the new growth theory in the late 1980's reoriented the theoretical discussions of growth towards emphasising human capital and ideas as a key to growth. Developments intentional meaning has been critiqued to operate in justifying the outside interventions for the purpose of economic growth.² Nevertheless, especially the northern institutions and countries have emphasized the need for this to make sure that the policies in developing countries are made under good practices and create long term economic development by attracting especially foreign investors.

The new growth theory emphasises the role of increase in human capabilities in economic growth. Moreover, it provides a way to understand the role of education in development theories. Evans (2010) argues that the institutional turn in development theory "complements the new growth theory (ibid: 42)". Evans argues that Institutionalist development theorist emphasize the importance of democratic decision-making processes (ibid: 43). These theorists see democracy as a "meta-institution", which promotes the quality institutions, which then promotes growth. (ibid.)

Schultz (1971) argues that one of the reasons to global poverty is underinvestment in human capital. Evans (2010) uses the example of a case study by Nugent and Robinson (2001) demonstrate the importance of investing in human capital. The case compares Colombia and Costa Rica with El Salvador and Guatemala³, which are all coffee producer economies, but have generated opposite developmental results in their economies.

Guatemala and El Salvador are considered economically lower income states than Colombia and Costa Rica. (ibid.) The reason for this according to Evans is that in Guatemala and El Salvador the coffee industry was in the hands of an "elite land grabbers", whereas in Colombia and Costa Rica a "broader cross section of the population" was allowed gain property rights and

² See for example: Chang, H., Grabel, I. & Wade, R. H. 2014. Reclaiming development: An alternative economic policy manual. [Second edition]. London [England]: Zed Books.

³Nugent JB & Robinson JA (2001) Are endowments fate? On the political economy of comparative institutional development. CEPR Discussion Paper No. 3206, Centre for Economic Policy Research, London

there was “wider variation of smallholder production”. In conclusion, Evans states that “when the elite monopolizes the land (...) and the rest of the population is forced to work on that land, there is no incentive to invest in human capital (ibid: 42)”. The result being that there are lower economic growth rates.

According to Schultz (1971) the potential of investing in human capital is that it can generate both collective and individual growth. Schultz argues that it empowers "people to enlarge the range of choice available to them (ibid: 6)". Thus, investment in humans acquires more knowledge and skills, which provides wider prospective of choice for people to choose the direction of their own life path and career. Schultz argues that without an investment in human capital one is bound to stay as a "laborer" if one is born to a laborer's social class. Therefore, investment in education gives also the possibility to disrupt the existing social classes of a society. (ibid.)

The capability approach is another way to conceptualize education in development theory from the perspective of social choice. It emphasizes the role of economic growth to improvement in human well-being, instead of economic goal being the goal itself. Evans argues that the growth of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) is merely a “proxy for human well-being” and not the goal. (Evans, 2010)

The capability approaches analysis of the means of democracy to promote economically effective institutions goes further and states that there cannot be preferences on what are the economic needs of a democratic society, but that there needs to be a focus on expansion of human capabilities. The expansion of human capabilities is only a means of development and not the only goal. (ibid.)

However, Schultz's conceptualization of human capital is an investment-based approach to education, and as such more coherent with the development theory of the 20th century, which emphasized the modernisation theory. Although, it considers the role of human capital to create economic growth.

Evans argues that “focusing on capability expansion as the key driver of economic growth fits the emphasis of the new growth theorists on the knowledge and skills embodied in the

capabilities of individuals (...) as key inputs to growth, and the emphasis of the institutionalist on the key role of institutional arrangements that foster investment in human capital. The capability approach is, however, more insistent than the new growth theorists on the centrality of public provision of capability-enhancing services. (Evans, 2010: 44)". The 21st developmental state agenda for education can then be identified to be a combination of these three strands of development theory.

The following chapter presents the ways education politics are framed with contextual references to Brazilian education politics. The next part advances also the theoretical understanding of the ways education as a commodity can endorse a type of legitimization of unequal education systems and universalized or even monopolized knowledge production. It enables a deeper analysis of the power relations in export practices that are necessary to understand the complex ways discourses around education (as an object of study) create the ways education practises are constructed.

2.3 Knowledge, power and education as a commodity

Michel Foucault (1977; 1982) discusses the discourses of knowledge within the context of power. Foucault's interpretation of discourse is broad and thus does not restrict its definition to signs and language but extends it to practices. Discursive practices do not only represent reality, but also shape and enable the imagination and social practices. Meaning that discourses can be used as an instrument of power, as well as an effect of it. (Foucault, 1982)

There are two concepts that are important for the analysis of the power of discursive practices in the education export: power within knowledge and governmentality.

Governmentality can be understood through the following arguments: firstly, how governing the entire population is done through managing the practices in the circle of life, such as birth, death, sexual relations (micro practices). Secondly, through "disciplinary power" that identifies the human body as an object that can be manipulated, such as through surveillance on activities that enables control over the individual. In other words, governmentality refers to political rationalities and organized practices, which provides a theoretical framework to how governments are connected to actions, beliefs and desires of subjects. (Foucault, 1982: 220–221).

Foucault emphasizes that the processes through which individuals are subjected to power, are made through subjecting individuals obedient through laws and disciplinary acts. Education is one of the disciplines that permits the control exercised upon the children's bodies and creativity. (Foucault, 1977: 171-228)

In discipline and punish Foucault discusses "panopticism" – a system of surveillance that operates by permitting the observation of inmates, but also to product new knowledge that ultimately subjectifies individuals under new discourses. Thus, Foucault argues that knowledge made in practice, legitimizes the practices of power. (ibid.)

The ways power is formed, and subjectivities and knowledges are created, which then are understood as truth are an essential part of education politics. Foucault argues that "truth" is embedded in and produced by the systems of power. According to Foucault the effects of truth

are created in discourses. However, the discursive processes through which discourses are constructed might not be visible. (Foucault, 1977)

Additionally, Paulo Freire's theory of banking education underlines this relationship with education, knowledge production and politics. It examines how pedagogy affects the personality of the learner and their whole identity (Irwin, 2012: 42). As argued by Paulo Freire already in the 20th century many scholars think today that the way to teach is not from top to down, as if the teacher would be teaching a tabula rasa or a blank canvas, but to create critical consciousness and understanding of the role of the school as the motor of cultural emancipation as a practice of freedom. (Freire, 1972)

According to Freire, this should be done in away that the students would not be subjected as Foucault discusses to become the agents of their own "normalization" and part of norms and practices that are produced through administrated discourses. (Foucault 1977, 1982) The normalising process according to Foucault is deeply linked with how identities can be formed and constituted with the use of education as a tool for power.

The concepts that are socially constructed in the power structures make the power and governance of knowledge subtler and its implementation into the structures of the society easier. In the process of commodifying education these effects of truth may impact ultimately individuals' identities in the form of the learned discourses, which then shape what is considered socially acceptable, true and desired.

Freire's pedagogy of the oppressed follows Hegel's dialectical interpretation of the development of the self and the philosophy of knowledge. Referring to consciousness as something that forms in the recognition of the relationships and of the object that consciousness is aware of or claims to know of. Additionally, the experience of being human is according to Freire only possible if other humans identify the individual as part of the community. In this view a human is only human through these relations meaning that a human does not really exist, but only concrete places and positions where individuals are defined in different ways to each other; for example, a teacher or a student. (Freire, Kuortti & Tomperi, 1972 [2005]:21)

This constitutes to the assumption that all relations are power relations, and that the consciousness, where one meets the other fight of their position, until they end up to the situation where one is the master and the other is the slave, as Hegel famously stated. (Ibid.)

Freire argues that only the oppressed can liberate themselves and the oppressors and ultimately the whole social reality. The ultimate goal for Freire was to create a free, equal and humanist world. Even though, it is evident that Freire's pedagogical approaches are surely bound to the historical, social and political context they were written in. (ibid.)

Critics argue that there is a great a possibility that neoliberal education creates more inequality and restricts the access of lower income group families to quality education through growing privatization of education institutions, as well as homogenizes knowledge (Leher et al.2016). Moreover, education is something that has an enormous power on the development of an individual in a society, and the power of education governance over individuals is normalized throughout the history.

When education is provided by the government it is assumed that the governance of the curriculums etc. is concentrated on the government, and when education is provided by private institutions foreign or national there is an increasing power over a large quantity of individuals to be affected. For example, many students learn history only through one set of narrative that is connected to the focused meaning of that narrative from the western premises of knowledge or to justify a certain political goal. Meaning that when the historians are focused on one narrative, they inherently leave other narratives behind, such as non-western ones. Therefore, the teachers that are providing the knowledge become tools for the governance. (White, 1980)

In Latin America the knowledge production systems that were implemented and governed by the colonizers where replaced by the international institutions in the 1950's at the time when the new imperative to development and development practices had surged in the global north.

The new development order and practices relied heavily on research and knowledge that was supposed to provide a picture of the "developing" countries social and economic problems that could be then be "solved" by development disciplines. It has been argued that these disciplines

have made Latin American as well as other "developing" countries effectively under to new ways of power. (Mignolo, 2011)

Overall, the history of the colonality of "knowledge" needs to be acknowledged when analyzing the discourse also around education export policies. Coloniality of knowledge is part of what Mignolo (2011) argues that the so-called western code is based on the European model of thinking that has merged since the Renaissance time and correlates to the "idea of progress" that every country should try to progress towards the European civilization.

Mignolo emphasizes that "western code" has tried to create the rest of the world as the extension for the version of Euro-American civilization and that these are codified power relations that have created the possibility to marginalize and that the world is operating under "colonial matrix of power". (ibid.)

This chapter shows the relations education has with power and the creation of identities. The following chapter identifies ways in which the state takes part in and the roles state can take in attracting foreign capital to the education sector of a country to create a profitable export sector, but as well to improve the countries human capital. In the case of Finnish education export to Brazil it is relevant to understand the role a state plays in the provision of education in Brazil as well as the role of the Finnish state in the education export practices.

2.4 States role

Evans (2010) argues that the intentional nature of development has set a demanding agenda for nations to aim to become more developmental. As presented previously in this chapter the means to transform societies and economies has been argued to be in relation with the investment in human well-being or human capital. However, while other nations have been succeeding in these desired transformations others have not succeeded in the same way. These differences have created significant differences between economies in the world.

Evans (1995) has questioned the states economic role contributing to the discussion on whether states involvement works or not in the creation of a developmental state. According to Evans (1995) the states role can be especially significant in new industrial sections to promote positive economic growth. Evans identifies different roles the state can take in promoting social and economic progress. However, he is ultimately interested in what kind of state interventions are required for development.

Evans (2010) argues that especially the “position of the state vis à vis industrial elites was equally propitious for the construction of a developmental state (ibid: 47)”. According to Evans local industrialists were firstly economically weak and concentrated on domestic consumption goods with little change of becoming competitive in global markets. According to Evans for the state it was more profitable to “put the state apparatus in a position orchestrate a concrete national project of development, built on a dense set of concrete interpersonal ties that enabled specific agencies and enterprises to construct joint projects at the sectoral level (ibid: 47)”. This embeddedness is thus central to the success of 20th century developmental state. (ibid.)

However, in the more recent versions of embeddedness focused on industrial elites, Evans has emphasized the “growing power of global capital and the growing integration of local capital into transnational networks (ibid: 60)”.

In Brazil the responsibilities of the state concerning education are described in state education policies, but previously there were no standards or enough regulation to education programs.

This has caused gaps in federal articulation and disruption of programs, as well as lack of resources in many education institutions, especially in primary education, but also in higher education. (MEC, 2014) In addition, lack of resources has always been a complicated issue in Brazilian education policies, but also to the private markets for education. (Leher et al., 2016)

In Brazil the 1988 federal constitution guarantees a federal system of education, financing of the education institutions and in educational matters, as well as ensuring equalization of educational opportunities and the minimum standards of quality. These are ensured through technical and financial assistance to the states, the federal district and to municipalities. The municipalities act as a priority provider of education services in primary education and early childhood education, and the states and the Federal District, primarily in the primary education and secondary education (article 211, paragraph 1, 2 and 3). (Planalto, 1988)

The process of market expansion in education sector has linked public and private education to capital rule. Leher et al. (2016) identify the following ways the Brazilian state is involved in commercializing education: 1. Granting capital access to public funds, 2. State incentives for the private sector.

In many cases public resources are also used in private education sector in the form of, for example, funding for students, scholarships, grants and tuition fee financing. In this way the state is a relevant player also in the private education sector in the role of a facilitator. In Brazil the students financing fund (O Fundo de Financiamento Estudantil, FIES) supplied 1 billion reais (approximately 270 million USD) for private tuition fees in 2010, and in 2014 R\$ 13, 5 billion. In addition, the business sector in Brazil receives significant tax exemptions. (Leher et al., 2016)

The key to understanding the Brazilian education system and politics surrounding it lies in understanding the relationship between social classes. In 2015 there were 2 364 higher education institutions in Brazil, from which 295 were public and 2069 were private. From the public institutions 107 were operated on federal level, 120 on state level and 68 on municipal level. (INEP, 2015) Private education institutions may vary from non-governmental organizations (such as religious institutions, which are commonly non-profit) to foreign and national enterprises operating in education sector in order to create profit. (OECD, 2012:7)

In Latin America the cost-sharing and the diversification of revenues have created a tuition and fee-dependent private higher education sector, whereas public universities do not have tuition or only a formal low-cost tuition has been introduced. This has led to a peculiar problem, where upper and upper-middle income families frequent the private expensive and superior secondary education institutions and lower income families the often poorly funded and poor in quality secondary education. Leading to a situation where the higher income group children are able pass the difficult entry exams to attend the free higher education, whereas the students who attended the public basic education institutions are forced to pay for private higher education or enter the work force. (OECD, 2012:7)

Meaning that if the state is not interested in investing sufficiently in the public primary education, the higher income group children still have the possibility to get a quality education from the private education providers, whereas the lower income group children do not have another choice. Thus, many of the lower income group families may not invest to primary or secondary education, and it becomes nearly impossible for the children to be able to enter the public higher education institutions of higher quality.

Moreover, families may be unwilling to pay for education, if they do not see the long-term investment benefits of the investment if they know they cannot afford to pay the private university fees later. Additionally, there is a possibility to exclude individuals from school attendance through high prices in the private institutions already in the primary levels of education. (Leher et al. 2016) Leher et al. (2016) refer to the case of Brazil, by stating that education can be used as to create certain kind of workers needed in a society to maintain the class division. (ibid.)

In the case of Finnish education export impact to Brazilian education it is not only relevant to understand the ways Brazilian education system works, but also how the Finnish education export sector works. Evans (1995) has identified different roles a state can take in promoting new trade sectors and these roles provide ways to examine closer the role of the Finnish state in advancing education export sector. Additionally, it enables an analysis of the power relations that might be embedded in this export sector.

The four different roles the state can take when promoting a new industrial sector are state as demiurge, custodian, midwifery and husbandry. According to Evans these four roles of the state provide a framework for labeling the involvement of states in particular sectors. Evans uses the concepts in the context of IT-sector. In this study the midwifery, custodian and husbandry roles are utilised as tools to analyse the service sector, more importantly in the education export sector of Finland. (ibid.)

According to Evans (1995) as midwifery the state acts as assisting "in the emergence of new entrepreneurial groups and to induce existing entrepreneurs to take on more challenging endeavors." According to Evans midwifery can lower risks, increase returns as well encourage participation from local capital that would otherwise not take part of the new sector. (ibid: 81)

Whatever the techniques and whatever the nature of the capital involved, the aim of midwifery remains the same: "inducing private capital to play an entrepreneurial role that it would otherwise be reluctant to undertake, thereby creating organizational and institutional resources committed to new sectors or new kinds of endeavors (ibid:82)".

When the goal of the state is promoting a new sector, then acting as a midwife provides low risk solutions, it also makes the state dependent of the private sectors response to it. It requires efforts from the state to get private actors engaged in the new sector. The effect of it depends ultimately solely on the interest of the private sector. Whether the new sector is easy technically to enter it can facilitate the process and create more interest. Evans states "midwives can make a difference, but they are, after all, auxiliaries (ibid: 80)"

Acting as a midwife the state can make new entrepreneurial groups feel more secure and thus make further investments and larger investments in the new sector. To secure this Evans identifies the need for husbandry assistance. This way once entered in a new sector with the help of the state as midwifery the state continues supporting the companies as acting as a husbandry. State can also set up companies to handle riskier tasks in the sector, such as research. Husbandry "involves a combination of support and prodding (ibid: 81)". Moreover, it is less demanding than midwifery, because the private sector companies are already in the field of business. (ibid.)

The state as a custodian is a form of a regulator. It provides caretaking, protection and policing. Custodian behavior "preoccupies with preventing private capital from engaging in undesirable or inappropriate activities, not with stimulating capitalist to take new risks (ibid: 80)". Custodial rules can also focus on encouraging private actors, for example by fiscal regulations "that may be designed to compensate for the difficulty of appropriating returns from innovation or to encourage investment in risky "sunrise" sectors (ibid.)". The regulations can also have promotional characteristics.

Evans argues that "while promotional strategies usually include a regulatory component, the custodial role is not a promising transformational tool. (...) When the state deals with a new sector by playing the role of custodian, preoccupation with policing overshadows the developmental potential of regulatory rules, and possibilities for transformation are lost (ibid: 80)".

2.5 Education as a commodity

The concept of human capital can be used as a tool to promote the discourse of education as a commodity in order to increase the influence of neoliberal approach to education and thus to endorse education also as an export product and a commodity. It is important to bear in mind also the public good nature of education when education is considered a commodity or an export product.

This study uses Marx's (1906) definition of a commodity to conceptualize education as an export product. Commodity is thus "an object outside us, a thing that by its properties satisfies human wants of some sort of another (Marx, 1906 [1867]: 41)".

Harvey (2010) argues that Marx is ultimately interested in the "simple fact that people buy commodities and that this act is foundational to how people live". Marx conceptualizes commodity also by using a concept of use-value. Commodity is then defined as an object, a thing that can be exchanged for something that has of use to the other that exchanges it. As use-values commodities thus may differ in quality and as exchange-values they may differ in quantity. Moreover, Marx considers all commodities as products of human labor. Commodity is thus a good or service, that has use-value i.e. satisfied a human need, and has exchange value, which means that it can be sold at the markets for money. (ibid.)

Education as a commodity is not solely an object that is being sold/exchanged for something that has of use to the other that exchanges it. Additionally, as Marx argues use-value commodities differ in quality and as exchange-values they may also differ in quantity. Therefore, when education is considered a commodity it is also subjected to these changes in quality and quantity. This means, among other things that when education is being subjected to the markets and monetary capital accumulation the role of the state in education is bound to change.

The concept of commodity can be understood in many ways depending on how it is defined. The definition used in this study is drawn from the work of Marx and it is being described as a capitalist commodity. This already has a set of ideological perceptions in the word capitalist,

which are to link to the concept of neoliberal education. Together the concepts neoliberal education and capitalist commodity lay out the conceptual framework of what is the perception of education as a tradable export commodity.

This chapter presented the theoretical and conceptual framework that will be used in order to analyse the case of Finnish education export to Brazil. The aim of this chapter was to deconstruct the main concepts that surround the discussion of education in the 21st century. The overall goal was to present the grand narratives that give context to those concepts and to present the roles the state has in this discussion and in the actual export practises.

The following chapters of this study present the methods and data used in this research, the case of Finnish education export to Brazil, as well as a discussion section and conclusions of the conducted research.

3 Methodology and data analysis

In this Master thesis, I have combined different qualitative research methods following a case study approach. My main method was face-to-face semi-structured qualitative interviews and a research questionnaire, which I conducted in spring 2018. Furthermore, I have carried out a qualitative analysis of the relevant documents related to Finnish education export in Brazil. In this chapter, I will explain in detail the different methods chosen for this thesis.

3.1 Case study approach

In a case study approach data is being collected by using different types of methodologies, so that the phenomenon in question can be understood more deeply. Case study is usually not considered a method, but more of a research strategy (Metsämuuronen, 2006:90-91). To make general assumptions of a case study is a challenging process and in the case of Finnish education export towards Brazil, there are many different actors and contexts that need to be considered when analysing the results.

The aim of the case study approach is to understand the different aspects, dimensions and curiosities of a subject in order to describe it as fully and detailed as possible. (Metsämuuronen, 2006: 90-91) This is also referred as the data triangulation, in which the data is collected from multiple sources with various methods. A case study researcher might use for example interviews, newspaper articles and official documents as data. A research questionnaire or quantitative data can be used as primary data. (Bamberg et al. 2007:24)

The triangulation of methodologies can be done in two ways. Both between two methods and within a method. When done between methods the aim is to overcome the weakness of one method with the strengths of another. When conducting a triangulation of methodologies, it is essential to consider the strengths and weaknesses of the methods in comparison with the

character of the research problem. The methods need to be chosen in accordance with the theoretical relevance that combines the method and theoretical triangulations. (ibid.)

The quantitative methods chosen for this study are semi-structured interviews, research questionnaire, as well as policy analysis. The gathered primary data includes face-to-face interviews in Finland, Helsinki, on November 2018, and via email on January 2019. A qualitative research questionnaire sent to fifty (50) education export actors operating in Finland and Brazil in May 2018. The research questionnaire was sent to all, whom had according to Education Finland's website been operating in Latin America.⁴

In addition, the gathered secondary data included: reports from mass media and official governmental documents from 2010 to 2018. The articles and documents were selected both from Finland and Brazil in accordance with the relevance of the report for the research. Articles from different media sources were analyzed in order to get the widest possible perspective of the issue.

The size of the gathered empirical data and the possible factors that these different actors have in common will show whether the results of this research can be generalized to a reliable analysis of the discourse around the Finnish education export and education in development. Even though, generalizations might not give specific responses of the case, it does give valuable data for further research. (Metsämuuronen 2006:92)

My hypothesis is that the discourse in Finnish education export policies has changed drastically since 2015 and that this shift has also changed the possible results for the export in education field through the influence it has had on the actors on the field. I am interested ultimately on the way the education discourse is formulated and how it validates in the global context of education export.

⁴ Education Finland keeps a record of all Finnish companies that have education export projects in <https://www.educationfinland.fi/companies>. The research questionnaire was sent to all companies that mention Latin America on their official websites and had contact information available.

The research questions of this research are:

RQ 1: What is Finnish education export in Brazil and what kind of roles the Finnish state has in it?

RQ 2: What is the impact of education export in the receiving countries?

RQ 3: How do the Finnish actors perceive their role as education exporters?

RQ 4: What is the effect of monetary capital in education?

The focus of the analysis is on the education export practises from Finland to Brazil, thus limiting the research into these particular nation states. A case study approach tries to answer to the questions concerning this case, but the purpose of a case study approach is not to study solely a particular case, but to participate to the larger discussion of the role of education in development.

I decided to focus on Finnish education policies towards Brazil rather than other countries for personal and practical reasons. Firstly, the context of Brazil was already something I had some knowledge from my previous studies. For linguistic reasons I chose a country, which language I could speak and understand fluently.

Secondly, I had already gathered some preliminary data during my stay in Brazil on how Finnish education was perceived in Brazil, which was one of the other reasons I decided to limit the case to Finland and Brazil export practices. Finnish education was something I had realized that held a special role in the Brazilian society, and for this I wanted to focus especially in Finland's education export policies. Even though, I am aware that Finland is a relatively small player in the global education export sector.

At first, I was going to focus on the perspective of the receiving countries, but then due to research limitations I chose to concentrate on the exporting countries perspective combining it to the context of where it is being exported.

As this study uses qualitative methods, it is important to also acknowledge my own position while conducting the research. I have grown in the Finnish society part of the Finnish education system, which means that I have my own views of what is considered a quality education. I have had opportunities to experience other education systems than Finnish while in high school as well as in higher education, which has influenced my personal take on possibilities and alternatives for education practises. Thus, I acknowledge that this study is nonetheless excluded from my personal experiences on education.

3.2 Discourse analysis

Discourse analysis was chosen as a method or a framework for this research, since “discourse analysis is generally used to interrogate the situatedness of knowledge, the contextuality of discourses and the active role which spatial images play in political life (Dittmer, 2010:274)”. Therefore, as this research studies the discourses around education export it provides a suitable tool for analysis.

Discourse analysis analyzes the linguistic construction of the discourses through the analysis of a text. Some argue that discourse analysis is more a theoretical idea or a framework than a research method. Discourse analysis usually focuses on the language. Essential for discourse analysis is that the text is not analyzed to find out the positions behind it but to find out what is the possible function or purpose of the text. (Hirsjärvi & Hurme, 2009)

Discourse analysis is conducted by a “systematic analysis of a social practices as an analytically distinct dimension of discursive practice (Jørgensen and Phillips, 2002:167)”. Discourse analysis is generally very detailed and aimed to recognize the differences and similarities from the gathered data. (Hirsjärvi & Hurme, 2009)

Additionally, critical discourse analysis distinguishes the discursive and the non-discursive, it can theorize discourses as a form of hegemonic power and if analyzed through the context of power can “discourse be almost synonymous with hegemony itself so far as it functions to conceal the power of vested interests and to induce the consent of the dominated to their own domination (Lees, 2004:102)”.

Discourses are not “simply reflections or (mis)reflections of “reality”; rather they create their own “regimes of truth”- the acceptable formulation of problems and solutions to those problems (Lees, 2004:102-3)”, which means that in post-structuralist terms we can understand subjectivity the way that individuals engage with different discourses and social practices. (Dittmer, 2010:277)

Discourse analysis as a method is criticized of its epistemological difficulty. The question of how researchers can reveal understanding of their own society, when being part of that society

themselves share many of those understandings. (Jørgensen and Phillips, 2002:178) Bearing this in mind the results of this research are not considered as “truth” that would be excluded from hidden power relations or from my own values. It is evident that the research can never be truly free from the values of the cultural, social, historical and political context it is being conducted in.

3.3 Documentary analysis

Discourse analysis from documents can be done using analyzing different discourses in the documents, such as who said what, when, how, and in what context. Documentary analysis combined with other qualitative methods provide an increase to the validity of the research. (Bowen, 2009)

The purpose of document analysis is to analyze the content of the documents by thinking questions like who said and what, how it was said, when and in what kind of context and what effects it had. Documentary analysis as a method reviews and evaluates documents systematically. An important part of documentary analysis is finding the relevant documents for the study. It is necessary to bear in mind that the documents should not be chosen to reach the goals of the research. (ibid.)

In this research, the gathered secondary documentary data included: thirteen articles from mass media and official governmental documents from 2010 to 2018. The articles and documents were selected both from Finland and Brazil in accordance with the relevance of the report for the research. Articles from different media sources were analyzed in order to get the widest possible perspective of the issue.

The chosen media sources for the Finnish articles were YLE (the Finnish national broadcast company) and Helsingin Sanomat newspaper, which is part of the Sanoma Pro media house. The chosen Brazilian mass media articles were from Veja, Exame and GGN. Other media articles were considered from different sources, such as from Globo and Folha de S. Paulo, but were ultimately left out.

Reasons for the exclusion of these two medias was the criticism they, especially Globo, have faced in the recent years for being biased and having a certain agenda. Nevertheless, the articles chosen were mostly written from the same perspective. The chosen media sources Exame, Veja and GGN are not likely to be less biased, but for the purposes of this research it was essential to find media articles that give an overview of the common discourse of Finnish education in Brazil.

The article from GGN, was originally published in the Spanish newspaper Vanguardia, which is one of the reasons it was chosen for this study, to provide a critical perspective, which is possibly less influenced than the others of the Brazilian domestic politics.

As for the Finnish media articles, YLE's articles were chosen for the following three reasons: 1. it is the national broadcast company that is most followed in Finland, 2. YLE had the most articles published of the subject in comparison to other media sources and 3. the objective of this reason is to analyse the states discourses around education export, and YLE is a national broadcast company. Nevertheless, it is clear that YLE as a national broadcast company is never completely neutral, so I chose to analyse also articles from Helsingin Sanomat, and one from Suomen Kuvalehti to compare the gathered data.

I chose to focus the analysis on the Finnish governmental documents instead of Brazilian ones, since I had already decided that I will focus on the role of Finnish state, in Finnish education export policies. The Finnish documents chosen for the study were chosen from the years between 2010 to 2018 to grasp the possibly different stages of the discourse on education export in Finland.

The first chosen document was a report produced by Demos Helsinki "Finland will solve the worlds wicked problems, considered it solved" from the year 2010. This was chosen as it was the first one that identifies Finnish education as something that can be used explicitly to solve developmental problems in the world.

The second document was "Suomi kansainvälisille koulutusmarkkinoille. Toimenpideohjelma koulutusviennin edellytysten parantamiseksi (Finland to the international education markets. An action plan to improve education export possibilities)". The report was published by the ministry of education and culture in 2013. This document was chosen as it was the first one to mention education in the context of export, as well as the first official public document that had a clear intention towards education export policies.

The third document was "Koulutusviennin tiekartta 2016-2019 (Roadmap to education export 2016-2019)", which was published by the ministry of education and culture in 2016. This was

chosen as it was the first education export related report that was published after the elections of 2015 and included the new governmental goals for education.

The last Finnish governmental document chosen for this research was a report published by Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland but it was conducted by an independent research group in 2018. The report “Stepping up Finland’s global role in education” was chosen as it was the most recent document published in the field of education export. Additionally, it was the first one published in English and by the Ministry for Foreign Affairs.

I decided to analyse the latest educational program of Brazil from 2015, to gain insight of the Brazilian education goals. Twenty goals were identified from the report. However, the program is already relatively old and due to the changing political circumstances in Brazil I decided not to include it as secondary data.

Additionally, the document from Brazilian ministry of science, technology and innovation was chosen to this study to understand the relations between Finland and Brazil in the field of education.⁵ The report focuses on the bilateral cooperation between Finland and Brazil in science and education co-operation. The report identifies the goals, objectives and ongoing projects between the two countries. This document helped me to understand the actual co-operation between the two countries in a more detailed way.

Overall, the analysed documents provide data on Finnish education policies in Brazil as well as internationally. The information of the documents that was of interest for this research are the states role and whether the education export was seen in positive or negative light, and whether they indicated signs of commodification of education. Positive and negative were analysed under critical discourse theory language analysis with the help of the created coding frame.

⁵ Cooperação Finlândia-Brasil em Ciência, Tecnologia e Inovação, Nota Informativa n. 17- Assin/MCTI (10.08.2016) (Co-operation Finland Brazil in science, technology and innovation)

3.4 Interviews and the research questionnaire

Interview is one of the basic ways to gather information. It is one of the most used methodology in social sciences. Interview is a flexible method and it can be applied in many types of researches to gather information. Interview as a qualitative research method is always a result of co-operation between the researcher and the interviewed. Interview is based on the use of language and this way it is a very effective method to conduct discourse analysis. It consists of the meaning and interpretation of linguistic characters. As language is an essential part of interviews the interviewed may try to present their own views of the given subject and the interviewer is left with the task to figure out how the interviewed is constructing these meanings of the subject of the study. (Hirsjärvi & Hurme, 2009)

Eskola et al. (2008) identify four different types of interviews; structured research questionnaires, semi structured interviews, theme interviews and open interviews. In this research the methods chosen were semi structured interviews and structured research questionnaire. In structured research questionnaire the questions are laid out by the researcher and are the same for all the respondents. In the conducted semi structured interviews, the preliminary questions are the same for all those interviewed. The interviewed may respond with their own words, which can then lead to surfacing of other questions that might shape the course of the interview. (ibid.)

Hirsjärvi and Hurme use the term thematical interview when talking about semi-structured interview. In a thematical interview, certain chosen topics are being discussed. The core idea is that the interpretations that people have, and the meanings people give are in the heart of the communication in the interview situation. Additionally, the main aspect of thematical interview is that the themes of interview are the same for all the interviewed. (Hirsjärvi & Hurme, 2009:48)

The aim of a semi structured interview is to collect in-depth information not available through other methods. While conducting a face-to face interview the researchers are directly involved

with the subjects, this enables them to analyse the interviewees behaviour. (Hirsjärvi & Hurme, 2009)

Interview as an object of discursive research is interested especially of the changes in the use of language. The focus is then on how different practises and ways of talking can create and maintain social meanings. To find out the ways the discourse is formed in the practices of education export I chose three different themes for the interviews. Themes chosen where the states role in education export, quality of education and general questions.

I conducted face-to-face interviews in Finland, Helsinki, on November 2018, and via email on January 2019. Additionally, a qualitative research questionnaire was sent to fifty (50) education export actors operating in Finland and Brazil in May 2018, from which there were eight (8) full responds and four (4) responds stating that they had no projects in Brazil at the moment. From these the eight (8) full responds were analyzed.

The conducted interviews were all approximately one hour long. Even though, most of the interviews did go without any further problems, the research topic seemed to raise many emotions on the interviewed during the interviews. Additionally, sometimes I felt that the interviewed were trying to “sell me the idea” of a perfect concept of education export. Some of the interviewed also wanted to separate themselves clearly from the export sector, and to be identified more as an actor in the co-operation sector, when speaking of education as a commodity at the same time. In addition, three of the interviewed specified that they do not want their interview transcripts to be published.

As for the research questionnaire, the aim is to minimize the impact the researcher has in the collection of the data, which would enable the research to be more objective. The researcher does have an impact when constructing the research questionnaire, such as choosing the questions and areas of interests. (ibid) Nevertheless, the purpose of the research questionnaire was to reach more actors in the education export field, as well as to give them an opportunity to respond anonymously for the questions, without the pressure of being in a face-to-face interview.

Research questionnaire in this study was used in a way of e-mail questionnaire. In the questionnaire there were open ended questions as well as a quantitative part where the respondents were asked to answer from scale to 1 to 6 the impacts of their projects.

Advantages of a research questionnaire sent by e-mail are that it is cost effective and can reach more respondents than solely an interview. Disadvantages of a research questionnaire sent by e-mail are that many might ignore the research questionnaire sent to them. Additionally, it does not provide a platform for the respondents to express their opinion on the given matter thoroughly or the respondents might not read the questions carefully and thus the results can be affected. (Hirsjärvi & Hurme, 2009)

3.5 Data collection

Primary data was collected by conducting four interviews in Finland, Helsinki on November 2018 and one via e-mail on January 2019. The interviewed were of different sectors operating in education export. In addition, a qualitative research questionnaire was sent to education export actors operating in Finland and Brazil in May 2018. Also, reports from mass media and official governmental documents from 2010 to 2018 were selected as relevant secondary data and collected between May 2018 and December 2018.

The responses of collected primary data were gathered and analyzed conducting a comparative data analysis between the primary and secondary data obtained. The objective of this was to find out how the education export actors in Finland or in Brazil perceive their role in the context of global education both prior to the year 2015 and after. For the purpose of the anonymity and confidence of the respondents only formulated categories were used to describe the answers of the respondents, from both interviews and the research questionnaire.

In order to find out how the actors perceive their role; the qualitative electronic questionnaire was provided both in Finnish and Portuguese. Since, there were no Portuguese respondents the translations were only done from Finnish to English. From the responds five were from higher education institutions, one from a high school, and two from an edtech company/private company.

The interviews were conducted in Finnish, since all the interviewed were native Finnish speakers. The questions were formed so that the interview could respond to the question as wide as possible and to talk freely about their experiences. The interviewed were chosen from all sectors of education export.

The mass media data was chosen by analysing the relevance of the pieces for the research from different years in 2010-2018. Approximately one hundred news articles were searched from Finnish and Brazilian media, and ultimately nine from Finnish and four from Brazilian media were selected for further analysis. The mass media documents were limited to these thirteen

for the purpose of limiting data. The aim was to analyze further media data that is from different sources to ensure the reliability of the research⁶.

The official Finnish and Brazilian governmental documents were of interest in this research to research the states role in education export. Four official documents from Finland and two from Brazil were chosen for further analysis. ⁷

The gathered and analyzed data are only a fraction of the actual companies and institutions operating in Brazil, which means that reliable generalizations only from this data are limited. A comparative data analysis of the responds gathered from the questionnaire, interviews, mass media and policy documents together provide valid data to answer the research questions of this study and to test the original hypothesis.

The data analysis process goes first through the whole data according to the created coding frames. The first part of the process was transcription of the interviews and completing the results to an excel graph (created coding frame). After, a documentary analysis was made from the chosen media reports and policy documents. As the data analysis from the interviews can never truly be finished, it is important to discuss the findings with other data in the process of analysis. (Ruusuvaori et al. 2. 2012:18-19, 29)

According to Schreier (2012) categories of the coding frame are usually at a higher level of abstraction than the more concrete information in the material and the use of a coding frame limits the analysis to the parts, which are relevant to the research. During the research it is important to check the coding for consistency to ensure the reliability of the research, since the focus is on how the data relates to each other how the data and the categories relate to each other. (ibid)

In this research two specific themes were chosen to analyse the data in order to answer the indicated research questions: (1) states role, and (2) the quality of the education and the impact of the education export projects to the receiving countries education. The coding frame and the

⁶ Appendix: secondary data source: table 4 and 5

⁷ Appendix: secondary data source: table 2 and 3

frame of analysis were created using these themes, in accordance with the model of the research by Ehrnström-Fuentes and Kröger (2017).

I have utilised the coding frame concepts in the service sector to examine closer the states role in advancing education export sector. The coding frame thus indicates the concepts of midwifery, husbandry, and custodian (Evans, 1995) in order to identify the role of the state in education export sector. Ehrnström-Fuentes and Kröger use Evans concepts on distinguishing states roles in the context of extractive industries, but it offers a helpful coding frame also for the purposes of service sector. Ehrnström-Fuentes and Kröger argue that Evans originally created this analysis to “highlight the crucial role that autonomous yet embedded states play in enabling developing countries to become more equal players in the global political economy (Ehrnström-Fuentes, Kröger, 2017:7)”.

I will use the concepts in accordance with Ehrnström-Fuentes and Krögers research and look into how and when these policy tools are used to in fact possibly to enable the weakening the development of public education, fostering inequality in accordance with foreign owned enterprises ultimately contributing to underdevelopment of certain areas, not necessary between countries, moreover within a country.

As argued in the previous chapters of this study, the creation of education as a commodity is a process where the states role can be significant. The state can play various roles in different trade sectors depending on its interests. For example, the state can either acts as promoting the incentives that creates a profitable market environment for companies, or different actors to operate in wanted sector.

Therefore, to analyse the quality and impact of the education projects a specific frame was created under the indicated discourse patterns in this research. By identifying the role of the state in education export sector it was then possible to get an overview of the discourses formed in this sector. By combining and comparing the states discourses in education export with the analysis on quality and impact of actual education export practises, it is possible to analyse the discourses in education export.

The responses of the gathered data were analyzed conducting a comparative data analysis between the policy documents and the data gathered from the questionnaires. A comparative data analysis of the responds gathered from the questionnaire provides information of the way education export is perceived by the actors and whether they perceive their role the same way as the policy documents present the Finnish education export strategies. Additionally, it indicates the possible change in education export policies and its impact on the projects, thus providing a framework for discourse analysis.

4 Education export

GATS (General agreement on trade and services), which was negotiated under WTO in 1995 set the premises for using education as a commodity in three different modes: 1. cross-border supply, 2. consumption abroad, and 3. commercial presence. (WTO, 1995). The global value of the education sector was estimated to grow to \$6–8 trillion by the end of 2017 (Robertson, 2017). Effective data with an international coverage is relatively difficult to find, since education as an export commodity is a relatively new trade form and divided in many subsectors.

Countries that benefit most from education export trade flows in 2017 were Canada, Australia, United Kingdom, United States and New Zealand. (ibid.)

It has been argued that one of the reasons to include education sector in GATS was to improve education equality and especially access to quality education globally. Opening the education sector to markets was argued to have positive effects especially in low and middle-income countries as well as to countries, which were not able to provide sufficient levels of quality education themselves. (Tooleys, 1997) This argument has faced a lot of criticism and many argue that GATS was designed only to enhance the capital accumulation in the global north (Robertson: 2006, Knight: 2002). Moreover, by opening education to markets education was openly treated as a "commodity".

The commoditization of education has increased the commercial presence of international companies mainly from global north to global south. Additionally, the global souths private national companies offer various types of education services.

Education is thus seen as a lucrative service due to its role in reproduction of labor power and from compulsory schooling to higher education, which can be sold in the global marketplace. (Robertson et al. 2002.) The educational services offered are usually a combination of systems of teaching, school books and other education utilities, language courses, finance schools, digital solutions etc. These services can be offered in diverse modules for students in all level of education. There is a specific market also for distance learning, especially in language courses (Schatz, 2016) Operating in all these fields at the same time one company can profit not only

from tuition fees, but also from the education material, book, videos, TV and radio channels. (ibid.)

Most of the education export is concentrated towards global south markets, due to relatively same reasons why students from global south choose to move to study in the global north. Maringe and Carter (2007) have conducted a qualitative study in UK to determine the decision-making process made by African students. Their study enables to specifically grasp the motivations of international students from the Global South. They identified the principal “push” factors as economic stagnation or decline, political instability and lack of local capacity in higher education institutions in their country of origin. Escaping poverty and human degradation were also underlined.

In Brazil especially in the 21st century, big Brazilian groups have started to compete with European and North American companies on the education sector. Leher et al. (2016) consider the Brazilian market expansion in the context of trade openness and suggest that it "relied heavily on public policies oriented towards expanding access to education, alleviating poverty, modernization, innovation and social and economic development (ibid:2)".

Since 2001, when Finnish ninth graders were positioned first in mathematics, natural sciences as well as literature in the OECD's program for International Student Assessment (PISA) has Finnish education been considered one of the best in the world. After 2001 Finland has stayed in the top of the PISA Ranking. (Schatz, 2016) Additionally, Finnish education is also constantly praised in Brazilian media (table 1b) and especially the exceptional good Pisa results have gained a lot of attention in Brazil as well as worldwide.

The first Country Report in 2010 identified that Finnish education is globally considered a "success story". The report set the premises and goals to increase education export from Finland to the global south. Education export in Finnish context means "an intentional business transaction concerning degrees, educational practices, services, and materials from one country to another (Schatz, 2016: 21)". According to the first country strategy Finland's strength in education export and in the field of education are its "competitive education system and a good reputation internationally (CBR, 2010)".

Simola (2015) has divided the Finnish education success as the result of four factors; the appreciation of teachers, political and pedagogical conservatism and satisfactory of working environment of the teachers. In addition, the exceptional belief in basic education, wide and well-organized pedagogical system, as well as the cultural homogeneity of students historically are important factors of the "success story" of Finnish education. The importance of the factors is that the Finnish education "success" is not result to only one factor, more likely it as sum of different historical, political and social decisions and contexts and a mixture of this. (ibid.)

Therefore, Finland has focused its internationally recognized "world's best" basic education (Schatz, 2016:21) through different programs, such as, student mobility and research, teacher training programs and education technology (Edtech) (OKM, 2016: 18). Schatz argues that there is no specific way of defining what characterizes as Finnish education, but instead its quality and excellence are mostly associated with "Finnishness".

In 2015 this the Ministry of education stated that to increase education export the state should help actors/companies/institutions to recognize countries where the Finnish "education brand"-image is known. (OKM, 2016:7) When the Finnish education is already known as of "quality education" Finnish education export actors have a comparative advantage for their products in that country. For example, this is clearly the case with Finland in Brazil as shown from the media reports chosen from Brazil (table 1). From the chosen mass media reports only one was sceptical about Finnish education export towards Brazil, and not even this report showed any scepticism towards the quality of Finnish education.

In 2015 TEKES (nowadays business Finland) estimated that the total value of Finnish education export is approximately 250 million euros and the overall goal for Finnish education export strategy for 2016-2019 intends to increase the education export revenues to 350 million by the end of 2018. (OKM, 2016:15) In addition, Education Finland estimated that the annual growth of education export sector in 2016-2017 was 16 % and the average turnover was 500 t€ (in 2016 236 t€). From this 49 % of the actors had a turnover of 100 - 250 t€, and 33 % over 250 t€. (Education Finland, 2018)

Finnish education export revenues are expected to grow to 350 million by the end of the year 2018 it is evident that also other forms of education products are for now more profitable, which distinguishes Finnish education export from other education export countries. Schatz (2016: 16) identifies the following products for Finnish education export:

- Selling educational supplies / equipment to another country
- Selling educational information to another country
- Selling training programs, qualifications or expertise to another country (For non-Finnish, both overseas and within Finland)

4.1 The case: Finnish education export to Brazil

There are three different important sectors that can be identified in Finnish education export projects operating in Brazil (table 3): EdTech (education technologies), research funding and higher education institutions. From all the known operators in Brazil 6 are higher education institutions, 7 Edtech companies and 9 research funding institutions in Finland. In addition, the flows of international students coming to Finland and their tuition payments are an important component in the education export sector. (Table 1)

Actors Finland-Brazil			
Sector	Education institutions	Ed Tech companies	Research cooperation
	4	7	8
Brazilian partner sector			
Private	1	2	8
Public		1	1
Target group			
Teacher training	3	1	
Basic education	1	4	
Higher education	1		8
Other	1	1	
Date			
Before 2015	1	n/a	3
After 2015	3	n/a	5
Source: Embassy of Finland in Brazil			

Table 1. Actors Finland-Brazil

Globally, most of the economic benefits from internationalization of education comes from tuition fees through student mobility in higher education. Therefore, the leading countries in education export statistics focus most of their resources towards student mobility programs (Stern, 2017:2-4). This has meant that many countries have started to seek the economic gain of attracting students from abroad and the competition for international students has increased around the world. (Economist, 2016)

In accordance with this trend, also Finland introduced tuition fees for international students outside EU/ETA countries in 2017. (OKM, 2016:15) The estimated income from these students according to a report conducted by the Finnish government (OKM, 13.11.2018) was

approximately 2,7 million euros 2017, which is significantly lower than for example in Australia, where revenues from international education in 2017 were 22,4 billion euros (AUS\$ 32,3 billion). (ICEF, 2018)

As UK, Australia, UK, Canada and USA are still the most wanted counties to study and for providing private education institutions in the global south, Finland has a relatively small market share in the education export markets. The reasons for the small market share of Finland are language, cultural ties with the sending countries (such as colonial history) as well as overall knowledge of the country.

“Generally, Finns have a good reputation – Latin American markets however require mostly Spanish (or in Brazil Portuguese) knowledge. Finns should also have more possibilities to apply for outside funding, such as from World Bank.” (Interview 5)

Education export was emphasized in 2015 in the strategic governmental program as one of the main goals to increase internationalization of education and research, as well as to break the trade barriers of education export globally. (OKM, 2016:5) The most important target market areas for the growth program are China, Southeast Asia, The Gulf Region and Latin America. (ibid.) In addition, the Finnish education ministry's report states, that as education export is becoming a larger and more important actor in business, finance instruments need to be developed accordingly. (OKM, 2016:7)

International investment agreements (IIAs) according to UNCTAD are divided into two types: bilateral investment treaties and Other IIAs. (UNCTAD, 2015) In 2009-2016 the co-operation between Brazil and Finland was mainly based on research and science, and there was an emphasis on the word "co-operation". This is shown from the multiple agreements signed between the two countries and the parties involved.

The relations between Finland and Brazil in co-operation of education and science are registered in the agreement "Acordo de Cooperação Cultural, Educacional e Científica ", which was signed in 1988, and was put in practice in 1990. The co-operation was strengthened in September 2006 when the president of CNPq (Centro Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico) Erney Camargo visited Finland and the "Carta de Intenções entre o Conselho

Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (CNPq) e a Academia de Ciências da Finlândia (AKA)” was signed, with the objective to structure a bilateral co-operation program between the countries and to establish future research projects.

Between 2008-2016 other research and science agreements were signed between Finnish scientific institutions such as VTT, AKA and Brazilian counterparts such as CNPq and Fapesp.⁸

The table 3 indicates that in 2015 the visit of Jari Gustaffson in Brazil (at the time the vice-minister of economics), he was accompanied by both governmental and economic delegations. Resulting from this visit, three main sectors for Finnish and Brazilian co-operation in education and science were established: bio economy, clean technologies and digitalization. In 2016 the director of international affairs of the ministry of education Jaana Palojarvi visited Brazil. That time the emphasis was in engineer education, nanotechnology, research on zika virus, and waste management.

Additionally, the difference with these BITs from normal BITs is that they focus on co-operation and investment facilitation instead of investor protection. Their focus is to deepen the friendship and co-operation between the two countries. These agreements also emphasize the transparent and friendly investment environment, and technical dialogue. Nonetheless, they specify the importance on strengthening the ties between private sector and the government. (Brauch, 2015)

The bilateral investment agreements made between Finland and Brazil have the clear purpose to assist and ease the co-operation between the two countries, as well as to break the existing barriers there might be for education export in its larger content. The main purpose of the BIT’s is that sustainable development and policy objectives, strategic partnership on investment brings positive outcomes to all parties involved.

⁸ Appendix: secondary data sources, table 6.

4.2 The states role in education export

Finland's strategic government plan (27.5.2015) states four concrete actions for the Finnish education export, of which two are about breaking the trade barrier, removing institutional obstacles and legislative issues. (OKM, 2016:15)

From the four Finnish government documents two gave indications of the states role as a midwife and two both midwife and husbandry. All the documents indicated a positive approach to education export, and in addition "stepping up Finland's global role in education" was at the same time slightly negative.

Stepping up Finland's global role in education"- report focuses in finding solutions for the global learning crises, whereas the other three documents emphasize the export practises. Stepping up Finland's role in education- report argues that Finnish education expertise should be used also in the international development co-operation field. According to the report Finland has been absent from many global education forums and the bilateral aid in education is relatively small, the report states from 5 to 9 percent in 2006-2016.

The country branding report from 2010 states that: *"Building a lasting image requires more than short-term projects or marketing campaigns. We need real actions that capitalise on Finland's strengths and abilities and thus demonstrate them to the whole world (CBR, 2010)".*

Government documents					
Date/Year	Title	Source	MHC	Positive(p), negative(n)	Commoditization of education a, b
2010	Finland will solve the world's most wicked problems Consider it Solved!	Demos Helsinki	M	p	a
2013	Suomi kansainvälisille koulutusmarkkinoille Selvitysryhmän muistio. Toimenpideohjelma koulutusviennin edellytysten parantamiseksi	Ministry of education and culture	M	p	ab
2016	Koulutusviennin tiekartta 2016–2019	Ministry of education and culture	MH	p	b
2018	Stepping up Finland's global role in education	Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland	MH	p,n	ab
a=mentions receiving country education, b=mentions commoditization as defined in this thesis					
M= Midwifery, H= Husbandry, C= Custodian					

Table 2. Government documents

The Ministry of Education and culture has set the core goals and context for the current education export practices in “the road map of Finnish education export”. According to the report all business that is based in education, education system or know-how products, of which a foreign entity is paying from is education export is.

The report also states that the most important volume of education export internationally comes from tuitions collected from international students and from the evaluation, learning material and consultation activities provided to improve education systems internationally. In addition, the report states that there are other possibilities for Finnish education export, for example to export Finnish know-how along with other industrial export (OKM, 2016:3).

According to the report education export is a commercial activity and to succeed in this it requires to use and commodify our know-how and experience. One of the most difficult challenges is to build a Finnish, internationally demanded, providing sustainable growth in the export countries and to build education business that is built in the common set of values. (OKM, 2016:2) These values are not mentioned in the report.

The report emphasizes the change from education export to knowhow business during 2016-2019. The following sectors are identified as the most asked internationally: education system

consulting, curriculum planning, teacher training, leadership skills for principals, evaluation of projects related in education development projects, student welfare skills, early education and pre-school teaching, education technology, online education and vocational studies (ibid: 4)

The report is clear about finding and constructing products of education to sell. This is the overall core line in the report, which is clearly visible on the way the roadmap is constructed starting from the way it defines education export. As seen from the sectors that are most asked internationally and compared to the emphasized parts it indicates a division of the goals from Finnish side and from the international partners.

Therefore, it is possible to identify the promotional discourses the state uses in order to attract business to the education export. In addition, it shows a deliberate and organized way to create a positive discourse around education export practices in the context of Finnish education brand.

In conclusion "Stepping up Finland's global role in education", has a slightly different view of the role of Finland in the field of global education. It gives substantial emphasis on the Finnish development fund as in creating more projects in the field of education, whereas the other reports are focused on promoting education as a more "traditional" trade product.

The interviews with Finnish government officials conducted in November 2018 emphasized the role of the government in 2018 in Finnish education export practices especially in "breaking the barriers of education export" sector in the Finnish legislation. Asked about the receiving countries legislative restrictions most of the interviewed had not identified any issues with the receiving countries legislation. Moreover, one interviewed (interview 4) responded that until now there have not been any restrictions in the markets. However, another interviewed described the situation the following way:

"there is a significant importance in how a Finns presents themselves, since if another Finn has gone to the same place before, selling a Finnish education commodities with an attitude that we will "come here, and fix this, show you how education should work", then it is almost impossible anymore to try to portray an image of your own project as co-operation". (Interview 2)

The interviewed actors in the education export field stated that from the state, we expect a promotional role as the most remarkable contribution for the companies, but in addition there needs to be constant co-operation between different government offices, such as the Finnish Migration Office, not to make it harder to attract foreign students or teachers to training projects with strict migration politics. The interviewed actors also stated that Finland is relatively small actor in the education export sector, which means that the co-operation between the state and the actors need to be well managed and effective.

"We do not get any financial assistance, we have been using this money you can get from Finnpartnership, and so that we can start our own business in the field of University pedagogy, for that we have received some financial assistance. In practice, we have received none. Also, the university law says that this must be business, and not subsidized with tax money. However, we have ready products, so we need to work hard to have competitive products abroad.

Sometimes they think that because Finland is the best in rankings, and then we would have something amazing in education, but in fact it is not that simple. And that's when the business gets slow, when they understand that it is a complex thing. For example, something like the teacher training system. It is perhaps not in everyone's interests to improve it. Because there are people that benefit from when someone is doing badly, it is still unpleasant to see this, but it changes slowly." (Interview 2)

More important than legislative issues, for the actors in the education export field was clearly Finland's image in quality and equal education. This was mentioned in both contexts: to attract either foreign students or to gain leverage for the exporting countries in a foreign country's markets.

Overall, authoritative services include the co-operation with Finnish Embassies and Business Finland actors and their presence when negotiating deals and co-operation agreements with the importing country (interview 4). The role of authoritative services was emphasized multiple times during the interviews, especially in the context of Asia and Latin America, where Finnish

education export is being advanced by the state and specifically using the Finnish "education brand".

Education Export Finland program aims to support Finns Exporting Potential Training Products and Assisting in Business Skills (Education Finland, 2018). Education Finland Growth Program provides businesses, training providers and other training export operators with information on new business opportunities, develops export know-how and aims to make the Finnish education system visible to the world. The program develops new service concepts together with the educational exporters. The Education Board is implemented by the Finnish National Board of Education and financed by the Ministry of Employment and the Economy and the Ministry of Education and Culture. (OPH, 8.9.2017)

"It is extremely important in education export, that the state provides supporting services to the actors. Also, where the support is focused, that's why the focus areas are defined, they are mainly emerging economies where the state official's "insurance" or "acceptance" is meaningful. The fact that the state offers this kind of supporting or authoritative services is very important." (Interview 4)

"Co-operation between Finnish public sector actors needs to be fluent to enforce the image of education expertise of Finland. In a nutshell, it encourages the Finnish embassies, team Finland (business Finland) other actors to promote Finnish education to help its exporting. Case in point, because public and private in most of the destination countries are both operators of education." (Interview 1)

During the interviews the term commoditization of education was never contested. One indication of this is that the interview questions were formed so that the term commodity and commoditization were used while describing projects, and none of the interviewed corrected the language used. It was also clear that all the Finnish interviewed considered education export in a positive manner and saw that there is a difference between education export and education co-operation. Many considered themselves more in the field of co-operation, even though they did not contest the export nature of the co-operation.

"I use the term education co-operation, that when money does not move it is kind of co-operation in the education sector. We do speak of export, but I think that the Finnish model is more co-operation driven, that we are not just exporting." (Interview 4)

"I would say that what we do know, is not really export. But for example, now it is possible that IB-education would be sold. If we would start doing that, we would have to change completely the way we act –so it is not officially now education export. However, we do have some projects, where we are kind of commodifying the provided education services." (Interview 3)

"For me, co-operation is closer to heart than the export thing. We talk about something that is co-evaluation. We have Finnish expertise, and the scientific evidence, and the partner has their own. Then we go through together the project. Rarely, we have a ready education product that would be sold as such." (Interview 2)

"If a non-Finnish actor pays of educational services, then it is education export. It can also be co-operation." (Interview 5)

Additionally, the respondents of the research questionnaire responded "significant impact" to question, whether they thought that their projects have impact in the advancing of the Finnish export sector. They also responded "significant impact" on the institution's education export. The responds were same, in both before and after 2015 for those (5) that had projects before 2015.

In the analysed documents commoditization or exporting education was not contested in the Finnish or Brazilian media documents, except the one from Vanguardia. Spanish Vanguardia-journal published an article "Rio: Aula Rica, Aula Pobre"(Rio: rich class, poor class) on March 2017 where it criticized a private school opened in Rio De Janeiro "Escola Eleva", which uses Finnish pedagogical methods in their curriculum. According to the article the idea of the school was to build solely a school for upper middle-class students. It clearly differentiates the ideology that was to make all children from all social classes to go to same schools and criticizes the private school in increasing the inequality in Brazil.

The article raises an important issue that it is the heart of this master thesis: the role of the state in providing education. The point of the article in Vanguardia (2017) is that all children should get the same quality education and thus have the same opportunities in their future. (Robinson, 2017)

“If there would be more means on how also public institutions could apply for project money in the education export sector, it would be easier for us to work in the field. Now we have no way to charge from the services we have provided for foreigners, because as public institution we are not allowed to make profit. However, we are also not able to apply for project money, because we do not have the volume or capacity to provide the same type of application as the private companies.” (Interview 3)

In addition, as education is not solely a commodity, but is also considered a public good, there are certain curiosities that rise from how the state acts in different roles in the business of education. The data shows that the education institutions such as universities, high schools and universities of applied sciences cannot use tax money to sell education abroad. In this case when this is the only funding they get; they need to act partly like a regular business to get funding for internationalization purposes if they want it to be profitable.

4.3 Impact of education export in the receiving countries

The impacts of education as means to reducing inequality was not significantly emphasized in none of the data obtained in this research. From the responds in the research questionnaire all considered that their project *could* have positive impact to the development of Brazilian education. None of the respondents had any data to show from this, which some argued that was due to the relatively short time they had been operating in Brazil. Respondents also gave significant impact on reducing inequality in Brazil through their projects. From the analysed Finnish government documents three mentioned the receiving countries education, but only in general level. The analysed Brazilian media documents did emphasise the impact of Finnish education export in Brazil, and less the commodity nature of education. (Table 3)

Brazilian media					
Date	Title	Source	MHC	Positive(p),	Commoditization of education a, b
24.5.2013	10 lições da Finlândia para a educação brasileira	Exame	n/a	p	a
19.6.2015	A Finlândia tem muito a ensinar	Veja	n/a	p	a
27.3.2017	Rio: aula rica, aula pobre	GGN	n/a	n	a,b
14.11.2017	Campeã em educação, Finlândia agora exporta seu modelo	Exame	n/a	p	a

Table 3. Brazilian media documents.

The Education Ministry's report (2016:7) states: "Education programs from Finnish development assistance funds are not export but they provide international references to actors, which is considered significant when participating in international betting competitions." Mentions about the export destination are few in the Finnish public policy documents analyzed in this study. The receiving countries were given an emphasis only when the discourse changes towards education co-operation.

The locations that are been chosen for education export are according to the interviews chosen often on the basis of where the actor wants or is already operating, and then the state focuses to the promotion of Finnish education in these countries.

"Often, we are been contacted, but we also make the so-called market segmentation, and analyse where in the world the competition is too much, and where there might need for the Finnish model, or Finnish experience in itself and of course they are pretty long-lasting stuff, so if you think about the structural changes that happen in many developing countries there is a need for long lasting presence. The role of the state is that Finland should finance it more and even when the country comes to the level of lower middle-income country, the funding easily stops there. And when these countries have gotten used to get foreign financing, they do not have their own instruments in place, and in many countries, there is no ability to collect taxes as we do, and the state cannot come to help until after a long time."(Interview 2)

In this way, the interest towards these countries is initially from the companies and education institutions, not specifically from the states. Moreover, when the companies choose the areas to work in it can be argued that these are chosen in the basis of market opportunities instead of where there is the most need for quality education.

"It is certainly possible to develop the education in the receiving country, especially through teacher training. But I think it needs to be both ways that we learn from them as well". (Interview 3)

This raises the question whether this kind of programs belong under the category of education export or more to basic exchange. Especially the representatives of education institutions considered that they were operating more with the basis of cooperation. Moreover, in the interview 4 the interviewed explained that the schools exchange program provides possibilities for Brazilian teachers to come to Finland and learn from the Finnish school system and that it is an exchange system where everyone learns. However, when asked if the teachers from Brazil would also teach in Finland as the Finnish teachers did the respondent also considered it unlikely because the language skills of Brazilian to teach in Finland are not "in a required level".

Additionally, one of the respondents of the research questionnaire answered that they had a *"feeling, that the Brazilian partner has learned a lot"*. The respondent did not specify targets or

quality and in the interview argued that since it is an exchange program it does not generally have any evaluation or result based management. One respondent also thought that there is *"a lot to give in the sector, but the processes are slow."*

The Vanguardia article raises an important dilemma how the teacher training has created a new market for these teachers to change to private sector school, where they are paid better than in public. Thus, when a teacher gets "Finnish training" its market value rises, and they can then choose a better place for them to work, i.e. better salary and working conditions. One of the issues mentioned in the article was that many of the teachers working in private elite schools were actually consultants from multinational corporations and did not have actual teacher training.

As analyzing the media documents, nothing about the quality of education came across in the Finnish media, as shown in table 2. In the Brazilian media the quality of education in Finland was emphasized in all the articles chosen.

In the article on 2018 in YLE, it is also possible to identify two types of discourses, one from the municipal representative of the emphasize of co-operation and then one from the business side from the CEO of EduCluster a more export driven emphasis. As the mayor of Vihti, a municipal in Finland states that:

"The municipality of Vihti and the Thai state have preliminarily agreed that municipal teachers will travel through all of Thailand's five sub-regions. In total, they train more than 1,000 teachers during the upcoming travels. The goal is mutual benefit, not so much business (YLE, 22.3.2018)."

Finnish media					
Data	Title	Source	MHC	Positive(p), Negative (n)	Commoditization of education
15.8.2013	Suomalaisesta koulutusosaamisesta halutaan nyt jopa satojen miljoonien eurojen vientituote	YLE	MH	p	a,b
14.10.2013	Koulutusviennissä piilee markkinarako	YLE	MH	p	a,b
13.2.2014	Koulutuksen arvioinnista vientivaltti 13	YLE	MH	p	a,b
10.3.2014	Koulutusvienti ei vielä näy ammattikorkeakoulujen kukkaroissa	YLE	MH	p	a,b
10.9.2015	koulutusviennistä miljardibisnestä	YLE	MH	p	a,b
18.2016	Koulutusviennillä valtavat mahdollisuudet – alasta halutaan siivu myös Kaakkois-Suomeen	YLE	MH	p	a,b
14.10.2017	Hehkutettu suomalainen koulutusvienti on yhä pientä eikä kukaan tiedä sen arvoa – kokonaista koulua on vaikea monistaa ja myydä	Helsingin Sanomat	MH	n	a,b
7.4.2018	Peter Vesterbackan visiot hengästyttävät, mutta niin pitääkin, sillä hänen mukaansa yksi asia tekee Suomesta juuri nyt täysin ylivoimaisen maan	Helsingin Sanomat	MH	p	b
22.3.2018	1 000 thaimaalaista opettajaa parantaa ammattitaitoaan suomalaisin opein: "Suomalainen järjestelmä tuottaa huipputuloksia tehokkaasti"	YLE	MH	p	a,b

Table 4. Finnish media documents.

The following statement emphasized the non-profit making nature of education export, in addition he also states that:

"We have begun the co-operation from both sides with the idea that neither party is trying to benefit from the other financially. Of course, the municipality

cannot spend large sums of tax money to this, so it is perfectly natural that the state of Thailand covers, for example, the cost of training trips, says Mayor Sami Miettinen. (YLE, 22.3.2018)".

The costs that come from the project are paid by the Thailand side, however the article also identifies that:

"The ambassador (Thailand's) also talks about education co-operation rather than education exports. The benefit to the commune of Vihti comes from, for example, the exchange between teachers and pupils between the countries (ibid)".

This statement emphasizes the "co-operation" nature of education "export". In the same article the discourse of market driven education can be identified through the sellers and customer dichotomy of education export:

"Finnish operators do not compete with each other, the demand is so high, that there will surely be enough customers for everyone (YLE, 22.3.2018)"

The same article also states that:

"Finnish society has created an extremely interesting export product, the demand is hard, and the market is big. Unfortunately, trading is not very easy, Finnish work is expensive and we sell a pretty abstract thing (YLE, 22.3.2018)".

The image of a quality Finnish education is clearly used to promote and polish the need to buy Finnish education expertise. In the context of the actual programs quality of education was not the most important factor in the beginning of the project, but the question of the quality of a project seemed to have surged only after projects were already implemented. The responses of the research questionnaire indicate that 5 of the projects conducted by higher education institutions had a quality evaluation program in their projects in Brazil.

According to the responses these were mainly collecting of feedback from the participants and thus give only reliable data on how the participants of the project saw the project and not how

the project itself would impact the quality of the education. The other three had no quality evaluation programs, however from those three, one was in the process of developing one and one is considered more of an exchange program, which is why the respondent considered that quality evaluation is not part of an exchange program. Additionally, the Edtech Company that responded to the questionnaire did not have a quality evaluation management but was intending to create one.

Most of the actors in education export sector, the sector is relatively new and companies operating in the sector are generally only a couple of years old. (OKM, 2016:5) Which resonates with the amount of state provided help for the actors. For example, the Education growth program offers a quality label for Finnish educational actors, which is hoped to operate as quality labeling to strengthen the competitiveness of Finnish players in the education export market. (Interview 4)

However, the quality label is only a certification from the Finnish government that the company is selling a product, which is formulated according to the Finnish education plan. Therefore, this quality label does not guarantee the actual *quality* of the product or project itself creating an illusion or an imaginary of a quality product. (ibid.) However one of the interviewed did state that:

“Education export sells products, and services. We cannot really think about them as projects. There is no project evaluation. The means that we have is the education export system that works as a support network and ensures that the products are creating according to the Finnish education system. At the same time the members of the system have agreed to the values of fare trade. With these means, we have been able to interfere, if for example marketing has been a “little over the board”. Otherwise, we have then given feedback to the companies.” (Interview 4)

The government officials interviewed emphasized that the Finnish education export actors have the responsibility to be active on the field of quality evaluation, also towards the international partner. However, the state has no quality evaluation processes.

One project that stood out for quality evaluation is the Kiva school anti-bullying project, which has been operating in Finland and abroad. Both the state representative as the higher education institutions representative pointed out the implications would be severe if there would be no program evaluation projects or guidelines for a sensitive issue such as bullying. Thus, there is a mandatory evaluation of these projects. The projects are not evaluated by the Finnish partners, but the schools themselves, which indicates that the project evaluation mechanisms might not be standardized and that there is room for manipulation of results.

(Interviews 1 and 2)

In conclusion, although it seems that the quality of education dominates the discourse in "why" Finnish education should be exported, it seems to have been lacking from the projects in the field. The Finnish Education Ministry has recognized the lack of quality and the difficulties as well as weaknesses in measuring quality. It might be the problem for the customer satisfactory part, which would be more directly linked to the satisfaction of the product, instead of anything to do with the quality of the education provided. As stated in the report the markets are a reference, and there is a lot of competition, so in order to beat the competition the Finnish actors need to follow a certain level of quality on their projects to separate themselves from the competition. (OKM 2016:27-30)

4.4 Liability of the research and research problems

During this study the research has made apparent several limitations and problems. This part summarizes the liabilities and research problems of this study in an attempt to distinguish the problems, which are general in this type of research and those that were faced in this research. This should assist future development and research of the case in question, as well as the review process in general.

The initial idea in the collection of the data was to conduct interviews and send the research questionnaire both to Finnish actors and Brazilian counterparts. However, the lack of resources and time, as well as the negative responds or no responds at all limited the research data for Finnish actors only. In total 20 Brazilian companies and public institutions were sent the interview requests, as well as the research questionnaire.

Nevertheless, since there is only the point of view of the Finnish actors, are they always bound to the Finnish beliefs and Finnish way of seeing the education in Finland. For this it is important to remain a critical approach to the results of this study. To understand the actual impacts of Finnish education export in the receiving countries, in this case Brazil, additional interviews and research is needed and should be conducted in the receiving countries. This can also be applied to the generalizations of the results of this study to a broader discussion on commoditization of education and development practices.

In addition, overall, the interviews and the interviewed could be of a larger scale to be able to make reliable generalization or conclusions to answer the research questions. In addition, the case of Finland does not represent the whole sector of education export, even though the sector of education is still relatively new and small.

Additionally, there are many discourses around the topic of commoditization of education that rise from the different actors involved. To choose to analyze the states discourse was a choice of limiting the research. For further research on the topic it would be relevant to study also the other discourses relevant to the education export sector in Finland.

The interviews used as primary data in this research were all conducted in Finnish, the interview material used had to be translated in English. As the translations are my own, there might be some inaccuracies in them. Moreover, in the translation of some of the key concepts in especially of the research questionnaire from Finnish to Portuguese could have caused limitations for the research if there would have been responds from Brazil. For example, for the research to be thorough an emphasis was given to the fact whether the respondent thinks their project on education export had given emphasis on the development of the give sector. In Finnish the word used was "*painoarvo*" whereas in Portuguese the word was "relevância": which can be understood between the word's "emphasis" and "relevance" in English.

Moreover, when I was conducting some preliminary information for my thesis, I was already faced with an off the record comment from government official that "we do not use the term export" in our practices in the field of education export, but instead "we use the term co-operation". The government official also argues that many in the global south consider the word export to be imperialistic and since these countries were colonized, it would not be wise to talk about export when conducting research of the matter.

I believe it is important to state that when we talk about education export in Finland it is the same process also when it leaves Finland and reaches the destination country, no matter if the word changes on the road. The same difference can also be seen from the Brazil-Finland education and science co-operation report, in which it is called co-operation and not export. In all the Finnish governmental and media documents analysed solely the word "export" was used.

Another encounter I had that is relevant to mention, was when I participated on a meeting arranged with Finnish education technology companies in Brazil and a Brazilian education company. My observation was that the Finnish companies were going there in the purpose of selling their products, but the Brazilian counterpart was more interested in talking about co-operation and changing ideas. As I observed the meeting, I found that the Brazilian representative was somewhat humoured by the fact that the Finns were wanting to sell their products so eagerly.

Moreover, it is always bound to the researcher's ideologies and personal assumptions what they observe during an interview, so I have left these observatory remarks out of my analysis to conduct a more objective analysis. There is a danger that these have had impact on the analysis of the interviews and for what I considered relevant for the created coding frame.

Therefore, when analyzing the discourse of development, it is important to take in consideration also the researchers' objectivity in development practices, which can be influenced by the researchers' cultural and ideological background. Whether one considers that the researchers existing values will always have an effect to the choice of the research subject, but after this the researcher should and can isolate their own values from the research (Weber, 1949), or that it is impossible for the researcher to ever separate their own values from the research, and instead they should acknowledge it and let the reader know them openly (Myrdall, 1969).

I have intentionally throughout this research process tried to acknowledge my own values, and how these might affect my research. For this, I have also given them a space in this part of the study, before the discussion chapter.

5 Discussion

"In Economics, it is said that when something begins to be productized it changes the way that the actual phenomenon or product is understood"

- MacKenzie, 2006⁹

This thesis studies the roles of the Finnish state in the education export sector, focusing on the case of Finland-Brazil. The objective of this thesis was to seek the different discourses around education, and how these discourses define the role of education in development. In this chapter the gathered qualitative data will be discussed through the theoretical and conceptual framework of this study. The chapter is divided in four parts: discourse in education export: cooperation or export commodity, quality of education, impact of education export, and finally a conclusion of the discussion. This research takes also part in the discussion on whether education should be in fact tradable commodity and how it reflects the development theories of the 20th and 21st century.

5.1 Discourse in education export

Education has never been purely a public good or a commodity. The ways how education is perceived is a by-product of political and economical structures in the given contexts. One important concept identified in this study was the concept of human capital by Schultz, due to its position in global development discourse. Increase in human capital of a state is considered to generate better individual and collective income, and to then create more development.

The concept of human capital indicates that the investment in education and training increases productivity of the manpower in society and that to achieve the increase in productivity countries must insure the quality and equity of education in all levels. These neoliberal practises can then be hidden under the concept of education as a human capital, thus creating

⁹ MacKenzie, 2006: 29.

an illusion or an imaginary of education as something that will generate positive development for everyone if being used in the context of human capital.

Internationally, the GATS agreement in 1995 included education as part of the free trade agreement on trade in services. The agreement gave a conceptual framework for educational trade and contributed to the change of the traditional role of the state in education policies. After the GATS agreement education has been more impacted by capital accumulation and international trade. The impact of capital accumulation and commoditization of education shapes also the public policies and education practices globally.

Marx's conceptualization of a *capitalist commodity* as an object that can differ in quality and quantity offers a conceptualization of education as a commodity for this study. As use-value commodities may differ in quality, it also differs whether the commodity in question has use to the buyer.

Although, there is a paradox in determining education as a commodity. Moreover, if we are able to argue that education has become a commodity, it does not necessarily mean that it has become a *capitalist* commodity or that the nature of education should always be considered as a commodity. The expression "education as a commodity" can mean several things and cannot be diminished to overarching conception. Overall, we need to be careful in our conceptualizations in the matter of education export, since economic status of knowledge cannot be conceptualized through the simplistic dichotomy of public good vs. private good/commodity.

To create a commodity of education an active promotion of a certain discourse is required. In the case of Finland this study indicates that this has been done with incentives, new regulations and legislation. The discourse in education export in Finland between 2010 and 2018 seems to have indeed shifted towards a more market oriented and knowledge capitalist discourse. One of the interviewed (4) stated that:

"in 2006 after good Pisa results, it started to be more visible that Finland has some special expertise in education. After that, the interests from abroad started to be direct towards Finnish system. There was a concrete demand for Finnish

expertise. However, even three years ago we were not able to respond to the demand, since we had no experience of education as a business. We had no actors that would have known how to make it a business, and no ready products that we could sell. So, now we have come a long way. Education export has shifted towards a more professional way.”

One of the main results that can be identified from the data of this research is that the Finnish state has actively taking midwifery, husbandry and custodian roles in order to promote the education export sector. Additionally, as shown in this research Finnish education has almost a mythological position in the Brazilian society, as something superior that will lead to a better development for individual and ultimately to the society. However, in the light of this research it can be argued that the quality label Finnish education has in Brazil is partly a result of active promotion of Finnish education from the Finnish government.

Thus, the Finnish state has taken an active role in promoting the education export sector. There has been a clear push from the state official towards the need to expand the education export sector. Moreover, the data shows that the state has actively promoted education specifically as an export product. There can be various reasons for this, but one is to attract business to invest in education export and to create revenues through a new export product to Finland. As one of the articles analysed to this thesis asked: “is education Finland’s new Nokia?”

The most important role the state has are the offered authority and supportive services. These services give the actors more space to operate in new markets, through the provided readymade know-how on how some countries operate in the field of education. When the states takes roles, as a midwife and husbandry, it also creates a narrative of a prosperous and lucrative new market opportunities in the field of education.

In addition, it confirms the discourse of education as a commodity as positive, which is especially important if the commoditized item is generally considered a public good. Even though, this study shows that the discourse of education as a commodity is being promoted actively by the Finnish state, it is also constantly enforced by the discourse of education as a public good.

This result is especially clear when coding the data by using Evans (1995) different roles of the state in export practises. It indicates, that the midwifery and husbandry roles the Finnish state takes in the education export sectors emphasise the role of the state as a promoter of this “new trade sector” globally. By taking these different roles the state promotes the sector especially in the global north by using the narratives of education as a public good that have created the Finnish education success story in Finland.

Interestingly, as this study shows there has not been active criticism towards education being redefined as a commodity, and it has been accepted as an export product in the public media with not much or not at all criticized. However, I would argue that the reason for this is that it is sold abroad, and the commodity nature of education is not understood only as part of export sector and not actually education in its institutional form.

In conclusion, the analysis of the obtained data shows that education is openly being commodified by the practises surrounding Finnish education export. Additionally, there is a clear intention to generate profit from education export, and it is generally accepted as one of the main export sectors of Finland.

5.2 Quality of education as a commodity

The products identified in this research in the market of education export are focused on technological solutions of education, research programs, teacher training, Finnish Schools and anti-bullying programs. Universities and Universities of applied sciences have been the pioneers in the Finnish education export sector with their teacher training programs as well co-operation agreements with Brazilian universities and education institutions. Although, it is significantly different kind of education export than for example what Ed Tech companies do, since they are usually companies that are focused on education technology and digital solutions.

The data indicates that even though universities might not be as clearly servants of markets as for example EdTech companies are they actively taking a more profit-making role through the education export services. Profit-making is relevant for the higher institutions in cases when there is a lack of public funding for the institutions. In addition, the same lack of funding may be one of the reasons why Brazilian private education institutions might want to buy Finnish “quality” to ensure their position in the markets, and to attract more students

Additionally, the data shows that the measures for impact in quality or equality of education are not well-defined in the exported products or programs. In addition, the policies implemented by the Finnish state do not project or demand any improvement in quality or equality from the sold products. Nevertheless, there is no general rule that obligate the companies to be responsible for their acts internationally. In this case, as the companies are not under the same obligations as states or individuals, the ways the Finnish state promotes these companies in the receiving countries becomes essential.

For example, if a private company buys Finnish education export products, there is a high risk for the methods not to be implemented at all if there are no quality evaluation programs in place. Moreover, the data shows that the private companies can benefit from buying Finnish quality “insurances” for their education institutions and then attract more students with the so called "Finnish system" without any actual improvements in the quality of the education.

Thus, the question of what quality education is and who defines it, is in fact in this case a result of subtle and persistent country-branding. It seems that the “Finnishness”, which is the quality insurance of the sold education products is a brand that cannot be really traced back to know exactly how it has created the praised developmental results it has created in Finland. To ensure the responsible export policies and corporate social responsibilities of the companies operating in education sector it would be important to define what makes the Finnish education products “superior”.

Therefore, the assumption that Finnish education solutions would be better than other countries own is bound to the previous idea I presented of an “ideal education”, which has been contested in this research to create a need to purchase this ideal form of education. At the same time making some education systems or even knowledge more desirable than others. However, it is the society, the social space that defines the characteristics of a good and desirable education in that place.

Additionally, if there is a superior education system, then there is evidently a worse education system, which is least attractive for the “consumers” than the other “less attractive one”. This can cause that the role of government decreases more in providing education if it is commonly known to be worse than the private education. Equally, when the foreign private education providers become in the eyes of the public the more attractive education provider, also hypothetically there is a risk for the government to stop investing in education completely. (Schatz, 2016)

The quality of education is not something that can be measured, as for example how much wood is needed to build a house, for the simple reason that the effect of education depends also of the recipients of the education, the individuals. As Freire (1972) argues, there is no tabula rasa or a blank canvas that can be injected with all the necessary information to create a perfect individual, thus the results of education depend on the receiver, material and ultimately of the teacher.

The quality and equality of education are the two pillars of Finnish education “success story”, and these are the advantage Finnish education as an export product has been argued to have

compared to other countries in the markets of education export. In order to understand this advantage better a deeper analysis of the ways Finnish education is seen globally would be needed. However, the change in the discourse around education export towards a more commodified direction is more likely a result of a higher demand for better quality education globally. In addition, the Finnish governmental documents indicate that the government made it a priority in 2015 to especially commodify education and “break the barriers in education trade”.

These discursive actions are transformative actions of the conceptualization of education. Interestingly, until now the discourse on education as a commodity in Finland is limited to education outside of Finland or for education for non-Finnish nationalities, maintaining the discourse of education as a public good for Finnish citizens. Examples of these from the data are the tuition fees for students outside of EU/ETA area, as well as the Finnish policy documents emphasizing the need for growth in the education export sector.

In the context of transnational education export, a relevant question is then whether educational practices can be transferred from another culture or community to another. The question, which rises then, is whether the Finnish education export can have any impact on the education of the receiving countries education and is it even relevant to consider, if education is considered a commodity in its neoliberal sense?

5.3 Impact of education export

Robinson (2007) claims that there has been a transformation of Latin America's political economy towards into global capitalism, which indicates that this has made it easier for also foreign companies to operate in the region. Additionally, the change in the composition of the class structure in Latin America as discussed by Robinson has created a profitable market for education export in Brazil.

Souza (2018) argues that the dominant interpretation of the reality of the Brazilian society today, was in fact one that in the 20th century generalized the diverse societies of all Latin America. This dominant interpretation was according to Souza "an articulation of personalism and patrimonialism", which justified a view of the Brazilian culture as particular and pre-modern.

The idea of a particular culture was then according to Souza to be created "a romantic national identity" that was principally advanced by Gilberto Freyre (1990). Additionally, Souza argues that this romanticism and creation of a "particular culture" was used to spread the idea of an open and multicultural Brazil, where there is no intolerance towards different ethnic groups and social classes. This was enforced especially in the Getúlia Vargas era (1930-1944) for the purposes of the modernization of the nation. Thus, giving legitimisation to a discourse of a pre-modern time of Brazilian society, and power to the "Brazilian myth". (ibid.)

Souza states that this "myth" still in the 21st century gives legitimation to politics that might increase inequality. The cultural aspects in Brazil that are considered as a "truth" of the culture, such as the "jeitinho brasileiro (the Brazilian way)", which is in fact based on hierarchies that are commanded by the "social capital of personal relations", or as a bases of a "states elite". (ibid.)

In addition, these capital relations or relations of favor/protection are considered as a particularity of the Brazilian culture, but in fact are a way of maintaining a certain order of power. (ibid) This notion is important to understand the position of the Brazilian state in the context of education export policies towards Brazil. Additionally, Souza argues that the Brazilian

state is more commonly seen as unreliable and incompetent whereas the markets are seen as a place of rationality and virtue. (ibid.)

Education considered as a tool for economic growth gives possibilities for a situation where education is not provided by the state. However, in most cases the state has a responsibility to offer incentives and subsidize to the private education sector in order to ensure the equality in education in all levels for the purposes of a greater economic benefit of the investment. In this case the discussion of what is the impact of the private operators is thus essential, when education is subjected to capital accumulation as any other commodity.

Evans (2010) argues:

“to be developmental a state must support a distribution of basic rights and to give individuals incentives to invest in their own capabilities. Captured by an elite with an agenda of dispossession, the state becomes the instrument for wiping out those incentives – the antithesis of a developmental state. At the same time the state must offer, in Sen’s words, ‘a program of skillful social support for healthcare, education and other relevant social arrangements’ (1999a: 46). In addition to being instruments of achieving societal goals, developmental states must be vehicles for making social choices and defining developmental goals. (Evans, 2010: 44)”

This research indicates that the Finnish education export actors in Brazil operated mainly in the private sector. Several reasons for this can be identified from the analysed data. Firstly, the private sector has more capabilities to buy the Finnish education products, which generates more income for the Finnish companies, and secondly in the case of education exchange programs funding for lower income group students is more difficult to achieve as exchange programs require travelling to Finland.

From the conducted research questionnaire more than half of the respondents could not either indicate whether their projects have any impact on Brazilian education or had only a little impact. However, many stated that they feel that the methods have been useful in Brazil.

Nevertheless, many of the actors had a high interest to the results of the education export programs but did not have any quality evaluation programs. There can be several reasons for this, but the most relevant is probably the fact that it has not been required from them. I

In development assistance programs there is usually a clear requirement to evaluate your programs, however in market driven export practices there is no need to evaluate whether the investment had actual implication in the area the investment was conducted. This is an important notion, because in order to know whether some project has had a desired impact in the receiving end, it must be measured somehow.

The starting point for the Finnish education export and why it is being done in the first place as the data analysed in this research shows was to decrease inequality globally, and to increase the quality and equity of provided education. Therefore, it should be alarming that most of the Finnish actors believe that the easiest way to get to the markets is to go through the private education sector. Only after being asked whether they wanted to operate also in the public sector they responded that “the state sometimes adopts these practises later in the public education sector”.

It would be then easy to assume that Finnish education is thus considered mainly an income-generating export product and Finland is actively commodifying its education for global markets. The data from this research shows that since the Finnish education export sector is relatively new, and there are many actors operating in the field are also the interests of these actors different. The education products vary from research funding, to teacher training, to attracting foreign students, creating Finnish curriculum schools abroad, and to selling Finnish education technology. This makes the sector difficult to regulate and require the same requirements for quality.

Nevertheless, Finnish education export actors are focusing on the private sector, there is a risk that only the higher income group children and families benefit from the possible effects of Finnish education export to Brazilian education sector and the gap between higher and lower income group children’s development of human capabilities widens.

As shown in this research it is possible that there is a gap of low quality or non-existing education options for children in one country, which can be filled by using the services of a foreign or national private company. However, when the responsibility of education services is given to a private company should then also the notion to deliver the promised increase in human capital be questioned as was questioned by Leher et al. (2016).

Neoliberalism as a discourse emphasizes the detached, isolated individual, freedom and free trade. In addition, neoliberalism as an ideology legitimates individual survival, and that the survival of an individual is judged on market basis. In the Brazilian context, this might be in favor of some social and political groups as argued by Souza (2018). Additionally, enabling the private education provision in Brazil it indicates means of creating unequal possibilities for the individual to improve their human capabilities.

The neoliberal approach to education analysed through the use of education as exercising power over individuals. Foucault argues that “we” can resist and oppose forms of political subjection and domination at any time. The problem is to recognise when modern power is being exercised. In this case, whether education is being used willingly or non-willingly to govern the subjectivity through development practices or neoliberal economic practices.

Additionally, Foucault (1977) argued, that there are different processes through which individuals are subjected to power. These processes are made through subjecting individuals obedient through laws and disciplinary acts, such as education. Thus, education permits a certain kind of control over an individual’s body and mind, especially of children. Foucault argues that this use of power ultimately subjectifies individuals under new discourses. Thus, knowledge made in practice, legitimizes the practices of power.

Moreover, if education is considered a way to create human well-being and thus achieving non-determined single developmental goals and economic growth is in fact a proxy of this then the provision of exported education can be either positive or negative depending on the ways it is used and distributed to the population of a state.

Education is never a material commodity; it is as Schultz argues also an investment. More commonly, it is an investment for the future of an individual and the society. As well as, an investment to increase the quality of life and the quality of development of a society. Thus, when education is a commodity, it cannot be treated the same way as a material commodity or it will lose its value, and when it loses its value, it is not relevant to purchase anymore.

Schultz argues that the increase in human capital through investment in education can its best disrupt the existing social classes and create a long-lasting change in societies. Critics have argued that when the concept of human capital is used in neoliberal terms and education becomes a capitalist commodity there is a possibility that used as such, education as human capital can in fact increase inequality and help maintaining the existing power structures.

The ways Brazilian state is involved in commercializing education is in accordance with the policies of an “enabling state”, which facilitates the operators in the markets by providing support for the private entities. The government has also pursued policies that have blurred the boundaries between the public and the private education providers in learning institutions indicating that the existing social structure is in fact in the interest of the elite. Education as a capitalist commodity can help to maintain the class division though providing only a certain type of education to a certain group of people or to provide education only for those who can afford it. Education as a commodity is thus subjected to the use of power.

Moreover, when education is provided by the government it is evident that the governance of the curriculums is concentrated on the government, and when education is provided by private institutions foreign or national the curriculums may vary according to the interests of owners of those institutions. For example, if one company offers the same history module everywhere in the country, then all the students learn history only through one set of narrative that is connected to the focused meaning of that narrative given from the company providing the education services. Meaning that when the students are focused on one narrative, they inherently leave other narratives behind. Additionally, this can be applied to subjects that are more controversial in the Brazilian context such as sexual education.

The problematic of neoliberal education is that it does not only provide education, but also neoliberal ideologies that are also connected to modernity. As Mignolo (2011) and Escobar (1992) argue modernity is linked to coloniality, and development. The dangerous part from education export and internationalizing of education thus lies in Foucault's theory of silent and subtle influencing of individuals identity forming and subjectivity. If we are all going to have a universal education system through marketization of education and international education enterprises whose knowledge we are then producing and who are we becoming?

5.4 Rethinking education

The process of commoditization of education has changed the ways education is understood. Education as an investment to increase human capabilities can be understood as a means of creating well-being to individuals and societies or to increase economic growth. At the same time with the possibility to cross-border education export more of education is available also to those who do not have the means to physically travel to another country. However, when education is treated as a commodity the available education varies in quality and the access to it is controlled by market driven interests.

The case of Finnish education export to Brazil shows the different roles a state can take. In Finland the state has actively promoted education export as a profitable trade sector, with the interest in creating economic benefits for Finnish companies and ultimately to Finland. However, the promotion of education export sector has been done through the discourse of increasing the well-being of societies in the receiving countries. This promotion has also been done with the same discourse to the buyers of the Finnish education products using the “Finnishness” of the education commodities in order to get better profits. Nevertheless, the “Finnishness” of these export commodities is an imaginary “quality brand” that is based on the image of Finnish education as something superior and ideal.

This quality of the sold education is however not regulated or has no existing standards, which is due to the fact that the state has at the same time created another image of education as a profitable business opportunity for the Finnish companies. These two discourses are intertwined and create different imaginaries of what is the purpose, goal and impact of Finnish education export.

However, if countries start to rely more and more on international investors and cross border education providers would marketization of education have direct impact on the quality and equality of education in these countries. The impacts education export has in the receiving country differs also greatly on the context and of the receiving countries interests and politics. Moreover, if the receiving country is not interested in improving equally the quality of

education in that context there is a danger that the education export contributes to maintaining certain social structures and power relations.

The focus of the research of education export from Finland has been mainly in the way's education export is perceived in Finland and the ways it is organized. However, it would be relevant and important to continue this research to analyse it from the perspective of exporting countries to have an understanding whether education export can truly have a positive and long-lasting effect on the receiving countries education.

Indeed, more research on other important education export countries would be needed to make reliable generalisations. In addition, more research would be needed to analyze the true beneficiaries of education export.

As presented in this study the connection between the modernity, education, development and colonialism is evident. Escobar argues that western model of modernity always includes colonialism and that through colonialism modernity is always a form of power relations. The existing power relations created by colonialism and racism define modernity as a form of power relations also today. It is not only to define the principals of modernity as a way of breaking away from the old traditional and underdeveloped ways of living, as a homogenous entity or in dichotomies such as north/ south, developed/underdeveloped or center/periphery, but as creating different forms of power and control. Many argue that since development is so closely connected with modernity and colonialism it only serves the global norths interests and emphasizes the unequal power structures at the cost of the global south.

Education as a commodity changes the perspective of the framing of education in development theory. If education is a commodity, there is usually a company that wishes to make profit of selling it. Thus, the company needs to set a certain price for selling it, as with any commodity. The problem with education becomes when that prices is set higher than the average person can pay of it leading to a situation where only those who have the necessary economic conditions to pay for it can have access to education.

Evans identifies institutions as one of the main aspects for developmental success. Moreover, institutions need to "enhance, rather than undermine the capacity of the state to promote its

development efforts". This is the case of creating a "developmental state". The business of education has the possibility to change the states role in education provision and diminish the states ability to invest strategically in education. This can affect the strategic decisions of nation states in considering education as another area of foreign capital attraction. Indeed, it may be attracting to attract foreign capital in education sector to deal with the states fiscal deficit as well as to provide solutions for non-functioning education sector. The pressure of the increased commoditization of education is thus one consequence of a globalizing competitive economy.

Therefore, the impacts and opportunities for regional development and economic growth through education export is still minimal, while the business is relatively lucrative and risk free for private companies. Moreover, an important factor in rethinking education as a commodity and the conceptualization of human capital as a proxy for economic growth or vice versa reflects the fundamental aims of development. Especially, when human capital is viewed as an evident and immanent part of globalisation the question of how education is framed is central and what is the impact of this to individuals and societies. The ways education is framed may also be used as tool for promoting neoliberal ideologies and commoditization of education.

In conclusion, education has an important role in development theory. It can be to promote a certain developmental goal, as to create economic growth, or it can be a means to achieve human well-being as such. The findings of the thesis lay out a vision of a relatively new industry that operates in the very core of the creation of identities and individuals but is operated within the rules of market economy.

6 Conclusions

This research examined the case of Finnish education export to Brazil. It focused on the states discourse in the education export practises in Finland in 2010-2018. The hypothesis was that from 2010 to 2018 the focus on the discourse on education export has changed towards a market-driven approach. Therefore, giving legitimization to the commoditization of education and creating two separate discourses depending on the destination of education: global or local. In addition, the hypothesis indicated that commoditization of education in Finland is connected to the ideas of marketization, and commoditization of education globally. Combining this study to the discussion of education in development theory.

The results of this study show that the idea of education as a tool for economic growth emphasises education's role in development in different ways. This research shows that whether education is considered a commodity or a public good it is ultimately a choice that reflects the desired outcome and purpose wanted from education in a specific political, historical and economic context.

Nevertheless, education as a commodity is an object that can be exchanged for something that has use to the other, whom exchanges it. It can vary in quality and quantity. A key process in capitalist market economics in the field of education is that education has been subjected to commoditization as an economic product, and that it is now an important part of production and creation of economic growth.

In the context of Finland's education export the state of Finland clearly has promoted the education export sector as a new and innovative field of trade that is profitable. The study shows that this discourse has been enforced with means of creating an image of the usefulness of exporting education as something that improves education globally. Additionally, the Finnish actors seem to have a genuine intention to improve the quality of education globally, but no apparent ways of ensuring this. Thus, making the Finnish education export discourse also normative, and connected to the developmental theory of education as a means for development.

However, the data indicates that education is being actively commodified through the means of education export. Therefore, the discourse that is in fact the most common and used in the Finnish context in 2018 is the discourse of education as a product, a commodity that can be traded and sold globally.

The case of Finnish education export to Brazil indicates that the Finnish state actively promotes education export to the global south through different discourses. The findings of the thesis lay out a vision of a relatively new industry that operates in the very core of the creation of individual identities and societies but is operated with market-driven interests. In the light of the data obtained from this research, the issue of education as a commodity is not totally black and white, or positive or negative. The problematic of commoditization of education is that it does not only provide education, but also promotes neoliberal ideologies that are connected to modernity.

The case of the Finnish education export in Brazil shows how power relations in knowledge are subtle and silent and not always so clearly visible in the context of education. When analysing education export policies globally, the importance of the Foucauldian knowledge/power relations in education politics becomes essential. Additionally, this research shows how education is not a concept that would be excepted from the impact of modernity in development.

Therefore, when considering education as a tool to development one needs to consider the purpose of it through the connection of developmental theories to modernity and coloniality, especially when it's been used to promote the agenda of commoditization of education. In addition, it is important to emphasise that there are not only two ways to see education; as a commodity or a public good, that it is not either or the other, but in fact the concepts are intertwined.

7 References

- Bamberg, J., Jokinen, P. & Laine, M. 2007.** *Tapaustutkimuksen taito*. Helsinki: Gaudeamus.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009).** Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. *Qualitative Research Journal* 9(2), pp. 27-40. Doi: [//doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027](https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027).
- Campello, D. and Lemos, L. 2013.** *"The Non-ratification of bilateral investment treaties in Brazil: A story of conflict in a land of cooperation"*.
Available at : <http://ssrn.com/abstract=2243120> [27.11.2018]
- CBR, Country Brand Report. 2010.** *Mission for Finland. Final Report of the Country Brand Delegation*. Available at:
<http://team.finland.fi/public/default.aspx?nodeid=46802&contentlan=2&culture=en-US>
[accessed: 4.10.2017].
- Chang, H., Grabel, I. & Wade, R. H. 2014.** *Reclaiming development: An alternative economic policy manual*. [Second edition]. London [England]: Zed Books.
- Dittmer, J. 2010.** *"Textual and discourse analysis"*. The Sage handbook of qualitative geography, SAGE. Publications Ltd, London, pp. 274-286, viewed 27 January 2019, doi: 10.4135/9780857021090.n17.
- Durkheim, E. 1956.** *Education and Sociology*. The Free Press. pp.64.
- Education Finland. 2018.** *Koulutusviennin kasvuohjelma- jäsenkysely 2018, koulutusviennin tilannekuva*. (Educational Export Growth Program-Member Survey 2018, snapshot of education export). Not public.
- Ehrnström-Fuentes, M., Kröger, M. 2018.** *Birthing extractivism: The role of the state in forestry politics and development in Uruguay*. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 57, pp. 197-208.
- Escobar, A. 1992.** *Imagining a Post-Development Era? Critical Thought Development and Social Movements*. *Social Text*, No. 31/32, Third World and Post-Colonial Issues. Duke University Press.

- Eskola, J. Suoranta, J. 2008.** *Johdatus laadulliseen tutkimukseen*. 8. painos. Gummerrus.
- Evans, P. B., Evans, P. B. B. 1995 [2012].** *Embedded Autonomy: States and Industrial Transformation*. Princeton, United States: Princeton University Press.
- Evans, P. 2010.** Constructing the 21st century developmental state: Potentialities and pitfalls. Constructing a Democratic Developmental State in South Africa: Potential and Challenges. 37-58.
- Foucault, M. 1977.** *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. Harmondsworth: Peregrine.
- Foucault, M. 1982.** *The Archaeology of Knowledge and the Discourse on Language*. Pantheon Books, New York.
- Freire, P., Kuortti, J. & Tomperi, T. 1972 [2005].** *Sorrettujen pedagogiikka*. Tampere: Vastapaino
- Harvey, D. & Marx, K. 2010.** *A companion to Marx's Capital*. London: Verso.
- Harris, R. L. & Nef, J. 2008.** *Capital, Power, and Inequality in Latin America and the Caribbean*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers
- Hirsjärvi, S. & Hurme H. 2008.** *Tutkimushaastattelu: Teemahaastattelun teoria ja käytäntö*. Helsinki: Gaudeamus Helsinki University Press.
- ICEF Monitor, 2018.** "Australia's international education exports grew by 22% in 2017". Available at: <http://monitor.icef.com/2018/04/australias-international-education-exports-grew-22-2017/> [accessed: 13.11.2018].
- Irwin, J. 2012.** *Paolo Freire's philosophy of education*. Continuum books.
- INEP, Instituto nacional de estudos e pesquisas educacionais Anísio Teixeira. 2016.** *Sinopse estatística da educação superior 2015*. (Synopsis of higher education statistics 2015). Brasília. Available at: <http://portal.inep.gov.br/basica-censo-esco> [accessed: 19.11.2018].
- Jørgensen, M. & Phillips, L. 2002.** *Discourse analysis as theory and method*. London: Thousand Oaks, Calif: Sage Publications.

Knight, J. 2002. *“Trade in Higher Education Services: The Implications of GATS”*. *The observatory in boardless higher education*.

Available at:

http://www.unesco.org/education/studyingabroad/highlights/global_forum/gats_he/jk_trade_he_gats_implications.pdf [accessed: 6.11.2017].

Lees, L. 2004. *“Urban Geography: Discourse Analysis and Urban Research”*. *Progress in Human Geography* 28.1 (1 February 2004): 101–107.

Leher, R. & Accioly, I. (eds.) 2016. *Commodifying education: Theoretical and methodological aspects of financialization of education policies in Brazil*. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

MacKenzie, D. 2006. *“Is Economics Performative Option Theory and the Construction of Derivatives Markets”*. *Journal of the History of Economic Thought* 28, No. 1 (2006), pp. 29-55.

Maringe, F. and Carter, S. 2007. *“International students’ motivations for studying in UK HE Insights into the choice and decision making of African students”*. *International Journal of Educational Management*. Vol. 21 No. 6

Marx, K. 1906 [1867]. *Capital*. New York, NY: Modern Library.

MEC, Ministério da Educação. 2014. *“Planos de educação”*. (Plans for education)

Available at: <http://pne.mec.gov.br/planos-de-educacao>. [accessed: 12.12.2018]

Metsämuuronen, J. 2006. *Laadullisen tutkimuksen käsikirja*. Helsinki: International Methelp.

Mignolo, W.D. 2011. *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global futures, Decolonial Options*. Durham: Duke, University Press.

Ministério da ciência, tecnologia e inovação, Assessoria de Assuntos Internacionais. 2016. *“Cooperação Finlândia-Brasil em Ciência, Tecnologia e Inovação, Nota Informativa n. 17- Assin/MCTI (10.08.2016)”* (Cooperation Finland Brazil in science, technology and innovation). Not public.

Myrdall G. 1969. *Objectivity in Social research*. Middletown: Wesleyan University Press

Nugent JB & Robinson JA. 2001. Are endowments fate? On the political economy of comparative institutional development. CEPR Discussion Paper No. 3206, Centre for Economic Policy Research. London.

OECD (Organisation for economic co-operation and development). 2012. *“Public and Private Schools How management and funding relate to their socio-economic profile”*.

Available at: <http://www.oecd.org/pisa/50110750.pdf> [accessed: 6.11.2018].

OKM, Opetus ja kulttuuriministeriö (Ministry of education and culture). 2016. *Koulutusviennin tiekartta 2016–2019*. Opetus- ja kulttuuriministeriön julkaisuja 2016:9

OPH, Opetushallitus. 2017. *“Laatuleimasta vipuvartta suomalaiseen koulutusvientiin – kasvutavoite 100 miljoonaa euroa”*. (Quality branding to improve Finnish education export-growth goal is 100 million euros)

Available at:

https://www.oph.fi/ajankohtaista/tiedotteet/101/0/laatuleimasta_vipuvartta_suomalaiseen_koulutusvientiin_kasvutavoite_100_miljoonaa_euroa [accessed 10.11.2018].

Planalto. 1988. *A Constituição federal* (Federal constitution of Brazil).

Psacharopoulos, G. & Woodhall, M. 1985. *Education for development: An analysis of investment choices*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Psacharopoulos, G. 1989. *Economics of education: Research and studies*. Oxford: Pergamon.

Robertson, S. 2017. *“Making education markets through global trade agreements”*. Globalisation, Societies and Education Vol. 15, Issue. 3.

Robinson, W. 2007. *Latin America and global capitalism, a critical globalization perspective*. The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Robinson, A. 2017. *“Rio: aula rica, aula pobre”*. (Rio: rich class, poor class) GGN- O jornal de todos os Brasis, published in 27.03.2017.

Available at: <https://jornalggn.com.br/noticia/rio-aula-rica-aula-pobre-por-andy-robinson>
[accessed: 20.3.2018]

Ruusuvuori, J. Nikander, P. Hyvärinen, M. 2012. *Haastattelun analyysi*. Tallinna. ISBN 978-951-768-309-8.

Schatz, M. 2016. *“Education as Finland’s hottest export? A Multi-Faceted Case Study on Finnish National Education Export Policies”*. University of Helsinki: Research Reports of the Department of Teacher Education.

Schreier, M. 2012. *Qualitative content analysis in practice*. Los Angeles: Sage.

Schultz, T. W. 1971. *Investment in human capital: The role of education and of research*. New York: The Free Press.

Simola, H. 2015. *Koulutusihmeen paradoksit: esseitä suomalaisesta koulutuspolitiikasta*. (Paradoxes of the education miracle: essays of the Finnish education politics). Tampere: Vastapaino.

Smith, A., Bullock, C. J. 2007 [1776]. *The wealth of nations*. New York: Cosimo Classics.

Souza, J. 2018. *A tolice da inteligência brasileira*. (The stupidity of the Brazilian intelligence). Rio de Janeiro: LeYa.

Stern, V. 2017. *“International Facts and Figures, Higher Education, Universities UK international”*.

Available at: http://www.universitiesuk.ac.uk/policy-and-analysis/reports/Documents/International/International_Facts_and_Figures_2017.pdf,
[accessed: 10.11.2017].

Tooleys, J. 1997. *“Towards Education without the State: The Learning Society and the Market”*. Penn State University Press.

1 UN (United Nations). 2017. *“Sustainable development goals: Goal 4”*.

Available at: <http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/education/> [accessed: 6.11.2017].

2 UN (United Nations). 2018. *Education*.

Available at: <https://static.un.org/en/sections/issues-depth/education/index.html>. [accessed: 3.1.2019].

UNCTAD (United Nations Conference on Trade and Development). 2013. *Global investment trade monitor: "The rise of BRICs FDI in Africa"*.

Available at :

http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/webdiaeia2013d6_en.pdf [accessed: 26.10.2018]

Weber, Max. 1949. "Objectivity in Social Science and Social Policy". The Methodology of the Social Sciences. Glencoe, IL: Free Press.

Weinberg, M., 2015. "A Finlândia tem muito a ensinar". Veja online jornal, published 19.6.2015.

Available at: https://veja.abril.com.br/educacao/a-finlandia-tem-muito-a-ensinar/?utm_source=redesabril_veja&utm_medium=twitter&utm_campaign=redesabril_veja&utm_content=feed [accessed: 20.3.2018].

White, H. 1980. "The value of narrativity in the representation of reality." Critical Inquiry. 7(1), 5-27.

World Bank. 2018. *Education*. Available at: <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/education> [accessed 13.3.2018]

WTO (World Trade Organization). 1995. "General Agreement on Trade in Services" Legal text.

Available at: https://www.wto.org/english/docs_e/legal_e/26-gats_01_e.htm [accessed: 13.3.2018]

Appendix

1. Primary data sources

Interviews

- Interview 1. Interview with a representative of Finland's foreign ministry. Interview conducted and recorded in November 2018 by author. Recording in possession of author.
- Interview 2. Interview with a representative of a higher education institution. Interview conducted and recorded in November 2018 by author. Recording in possession of author.
- Interview 3. Interview with a representative of Finnish national agency for education. Interview conducted in November 2018 by author. Recording in possession of author.
- Interview 4. Interview with a principal of a Finnish high School. Interview conducted in November 2018 by author. Recording in possession of author.
- Interview 5. A written interview with a representative of Business Finland. Interview conducted via e-mail in January 2019 by author. Answers in possession of author.

Questions

- What kind of education projects do you have in Latin America?
- How long have you operated in the education export sector?
- Do you also work in other areas?

The role of the state

- How do you see the role of state in promoting education export?
- Has your company/institution been receiving any support from the state for education export purposes? If yes, what kind of?
- Has a representative of the government been in contact with you?
- Have you participated in an education export promotion trip?
- Has the possible assistance from government given any additional value for your projects?

Quality

- Does your projects have a quality evaluation program?
- How would you evaluate the impact of your projects for the development of the education in the receiving country?
- Which one of these terms describes better the actual Finnish education international activities, export or assistance?

Questions for state representatives

- What kind of education export does the government do in practise?
- Is education export promotion necessary in the Finnish context?
- How important do you see the education export sector now (2018) in comparison to 2010?
- How are destination countries elected for education co-operation?

- What are the biggest advantages of Finland in education export markets and what are the disadvantages?
- How does improving the quality of education globally is seen in your work?
- Which term describes better the Finnish education export, export or co-operation?
- Does government have any quality evaluation mechanisms?

The original questions in Finnish

- Minkälaisia hankkeita teillä on koulutuksen parissa Latinalaisessa Amerikassa?
- Kuinka pitkään olette toimineet koulutusviennin kentällä?
- Toimitteko myös muilla alueilla?

Valtion rooli

- Miten näet valtion roolin koulutusviennin edistämisessä?
- Onko yrityksesi/instituutiosi saanut tukea valtiolta koulutusvientiä varten? Jos on, niin millaista?
- Onko jokin tietty valtion viranomaistaho ollut teihin erityisesti yhteydessä?
- Oletteko osallistuneet viennin edistämismatkalle?
- Onko valtion mahdollinen apu tuonut lisäarvoa hankkeillenne?

Laatu

- Onko hankkeillanne laadun tarkkailuohjelma? On, ei, miksi?
- Miten arvioisitte hankkeidenne vaikutuksen kohdemaan koulutuksen kehittämiseen?
- Kumpi termi kuvaa mielestänne Suomen tämän hetkistä koulutusvientiä, vienti vai yhteistyö?

Valtion edustajalle

- Millaista vienninedistämistyötä valtio tekee käytännössä?

- Onko vienninedistämistyö koulutuksen osalta mielestäsi Suomen kontekstissa tarpeellista?
- Kuinka tärkeänä pidät koulutusvienninsektoria nyt 2018 verrattuna vuoteen 2010?
- Miten kohdemaat valikoituvat koulutusyhteistyöhön?
- Mitkä ovat mielestänne Suomen edut koulutusmarkkinoilla ja mitkä haitat?
- Miten koulutuksen laadun parantaminen globaalisti näkyy työssänne?
- Kumpi termi kuvaa mielestänne Suomen tämän hetkistä koulutusvientiä, vienti vai yhteistyö?
- Onko valtiolla hankkeiden laaduntarkkailua seuraavia mekanismeja?

Research questionnaire

Available in Portuguese here: <https://elomake.helsinki.fi/lomakkeet/88562/lomake.html>

Available in Finnish here: <https://elomake.helsinki.fi/lomakkeet/89474/lomake.html>

The responds of the research questionnaire are in the position of the author. These responds are not public due to the wishes of the respondents.

The respondents:

1. Higher Education Institute. Partnership program with a Brazilian University. Teacher training and student exchange.
2. Higher Education Institute. Partnership with a Brazilian state. Teacher training.
3. Higher Education Institute. Partnership with a state level Brazilian education institute. Supporting University of applied Sciences program.
4. Higher Education Institute. Partnerships with federal Institutes in different Brazilian states. Teacher training program.
5. Higher Education Institute. Many programs with Federal institutions. Teacher training.
6. Private education export company. Partnership with private Brazilian companies. Improvement of the student's entrepreneurial skills.
7. High School. Partnership with a Brazilian high school. Exchange programs and teacher training.
8. Private education export company. Partnership with private Brazilian companies. Many different programs.

2. Secondary data sources

All the sources indicated in the tables below were available at the indicated websites at the time when the material was collected in the year 2018. Screenshots of the articles are in possession of the author.

The actors of Finnish and Brazil education co-operation in 2017 are in possession of the author, retrieved from the embassy of Finland in Brazil.

Table 1. Actors Finland-Brazil

Actors Finland-Brazil			
Sector	Education institutions	Ed Tech companies	Research cooperation
	4	7	8
Brazilian partner sector			
Private	1	2	8
Public		1	1
Target group			
Teacher training	3	1	
Basic education	1	4	
Higher education	1		8
Other	1	1	
Date			
Before 2015	1	n/a	3
After 2015	3	n/a	5
Source: Embassy of Finland in Brazil			

Table 2. Government documents Finland

Government documents					
Date/Year	Title	Source	MHC	Positive(p), negative(n)	Commodification of education a, b
2010	Finland will solve the world's most wicked problems Consider it Solved!	Demos Helsinki	M	p	a
2013	Suomi kansainvälisille koulutusmarkkinoille Selvitysryhmän muistio. Toimenpideohjelma koulutusviennin edellytysten parantamiseksi	Ministry of education and culture	M	p	ab
2016	Koulutusviennin tiekartta 2016–2019	Ministry of education and culture	MH	p	b
2018	Stepping up Finland's global role in education	Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland	MH	p,n	ab
a=mentions receiving country education, b=mentions commodification as defined in this thesis					
M= Midwifery, H= Husbandry, C= Custodian					

Table 3. Government documents Brazil

Government documents Brazil									
Date	Title	Source	MHC	Positive(p)	Commodification of education a, b				
10.8.2016	"COOPERAÇÃO FINLÂNDIA –BRASIL EM CIÊNCIA, TECNOLOGIA E INOVAÇÃO", Nota Informativa n. 17- Assin/MCTI (10.08.2016). (Cooperation finland-Brazil in science, technology and innovation)	MINISTÉRIO DA CIÊNCIA, TECNOLOGIA E INOVAÇÃO, Assessoria de Assuntos Internacionais	MH	p	a				
a=mentions receiving country education, b=mentions commodiciation as defined in this thesis									
M= Midwifery, H= Husbandry, C= Custodian									

Table 4. Finnish media

Finnish media					
Data	Title	Source	MHC	Positive(p), Negative (n)	Commodification of education
15.8.2013	Suomalaisesta koulutusaamisesta halutaan nyt jopa satojen miljoonien eurojen vientituote	YLE	MH	p	a,b
14.10.2013	Koulutusviennissä piilee markkinarako	YLE	MH	p	a,b
13.2.2014	Koulutuksen arvioinnista vientivaltti 13	YLE	MH	p	a,b
10.3.2014	Koulutusvienti ei vielä näy ammattikorkeakoulujen kukkaroissa	YLE	MH	p	a,b
10.9.2015	koulutusviennistä miljardibisnestä	YLE	MH	p	a,b
18.2016	Koulutusviennillä valtavat mahdollisuudet – alasta halutaan siivu myös Kaakkois-Suomeen	YLE	MH	p	a,b
14.10.2017	Hehkutettu suomalainen koulutusvienti on yhä pientä eikä kukaan tiedä sen arvoa – kokonaista koulua on vaikea monistaa ja myydä	Helsingin Sanomat	MH	n	a,b
7.4.2018	Peter Vesterbackan visiot hengästyttävät, mutta niin pitääkin, sillä hänen mukaansa yksi asia tekee Suomesta juuri nyt täysin ylivoimaisen maan	Helsingin Sanomat	MH	p	b
22.3.2018	1 000 thaimaalaista opettajaa parantaa ammattitaitoaan suomalaisin opein: "Suomalainen järjestelmä tuottaa huipputuloksia tehokkaasti"	YLE	MH	p	a,b

Table 5. Brazilian media

Brazilian media					
Date	Title	Source	MHC	Positive(p),	Commodification of education a, b
24.5.2013	10 lições da Finlândia para a educação brasileira	Exame	n	p	a
19.6.2015	A Finlândia tem muito a ensinar	Veja	n	p	a
27.3.2017	Rio: aula rica, aula pobre	GGN	n	n	a,b
14.11.2017	Campeã em educação, Finlândia agora exporta seu modelo	Exame	n	p	a

Table 6. Bilateral Instruments Finland- Brazil (retrieved from the document in table 5).

Name	Signing year	Effectuated
Acordo de Acordo sobre Cooperação Econômica e Industrial	05/11/1981	27/10/1983
Acordo de Cooperação Cultural, Educacional e Científica	02/06/1988	29/09/1990
Carta de Intenções entre o Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (CNPq) e a Academia de Ciências da Finlândia (AKA)	09/2006	n/a
Memorando de Entendimento sobre Cooperação na Área de Mudança de Clima e sobre Desenvolvimento e Execução de Projetos no âmbito do Mecanismo de Desenvolvimento Limpo do Protocolo de Quioto	10/09/2007	10/09/2007
Convênio de Cooperação entre CNPq e a Academia da Finlândia –AKA Memorando de Entendimento entre o CNPq e o Centro de Pesquisas Técnicas da Finlândia (VTT) na área de ciência e tecnologia, com ênfase em inovação e empreendedorismo	13/02/2012	14/05/2008
Acordo de Cooperação entre a Fundação de Amparo à Pesquisa do Estado de São Paulo (FAPESP) e a Academia da Finlândia –AKA.	13/02/2012	
Memorando de Entendimento na área de cooperação científica, tecnológica e industrial entre a FINEP e a TEKES nas áreas de tecnologias da informação e comunicação (TICs), microeletrônica e tecnologias de construção naval	13/03/2013	
<i>Memorandum of understanding (MoU)</i> Education Finland ja Ayrton Senna Institute	05/2018	n/a

